

**Energy Efficiency and Housing Advisory Panel
Meeting 6, December 6th**

Attendance:

Attendees:

- RuthAnne Visnauskas, Commissioner, New York State Homes and Community Renewal (Chair)
- Janet Joseph, Senior Vice President, Strategy and Market Development, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority
- Peggie Neville, Deputy Director of Clean Energy, Department of Public Service
- Gina Bocra, Chief Sustainability Officer, New York City Department of Buildings
- Dan Egan, Senior Vice President, Energy and Sustainability, Vornado Realty Trust
- Bret Garwood, Chief Executive Officer, Home Leasing, LLC
- Jin Jin Huang, Executive Director, Safari Energy, LLC
- Clarke Gocker, Director of Policy and Strategy, PUSH Buffalo
- Jamal Lewis, Senior Policy and Technical Assistance Specialist, Green and Healthy Homes Initiative
- Sadie McKeown, Executive Vice President and Chief Operating Officer, The Community Preservation Corporation
- Bill Nowak, Executive Director, New York Geothermal Energy Organization
- Molly (Dee) Ramasamy, Head of Deep Carbon Reduction, Jaros, Baum and Bolles
- Daphany Rose Sanchez, Executive Director, Kinetic Communities Consulting
- Laura Vulaj, Senior Vice President and Director, Sustainability, SL Green Realty Corp.
- Amy Sugimori, Director of Policy and Legislation at 32BJ SEIU

Not in Attendance

- Kyle Bragg, President, 32BJ SEIU
- Elizabeth Jacobs, Acting Executive Director, Akwesasne Housing Authority

Meetings Notes:

Recap from November CAC Report-Out (Vanessa Ulmer, NYSERDA)

- See slides 5-7 for details on CAC feedback and cross-panel highlights.

Insights from Existing Policies and from the Stakeholder Input Survey (Jodi Smits Anderson, DASNY)

- Recap of main subject ranges for policy options:
 - Behavior change (info to increase market adoption, nudges)
 - Market development & transformation (info to increase market adoption, aspirational goals, governance, workforce training)
 - Financial approaches (carrots including financing and incentives, technology innovations, training and education, resilience and adaptation)
 - Enforceable requirements and restrictions (sticks including regulations, bans, embodied carbon)
- Specific policies for additional research/further build-out (e.g. UN Sustainable Development Goals, Point-of-Sale ratings and process, CA Gridworks and Carbon Neutral Cities Alliance list of

policies, Toronto Zero Emissions Building Framework, Rewiring America, NYC LL97, Marin County low-carbon concrete, gas bans, Portland Deconstruction for embodied carbon, California Storage, Maine heat pump incentives, CA weatherization incentives)

- A New Resource – Building Decarbonization Roadmap produced by Rocky Mountain Institute for United States Climate Alliance (USCA)
- See slides 8-14 for additional details.

Discussion

- **Janet Joseph:** Have had opportunity to look at USCA Decarbonization Review. Considers it to be a comprehensive framework that is roughly aligned with many discussions that have been had.
- **Bill Nowak:** In response to challenges finding information about gas bans, Oakland and San Jose have joined San Francisco, Berkeley, and others in banning gas in new construction. Seattle and other international cities also exploring
 - **Jodi:** Did include information about this, but her assessment is that there is not a lot of traction for gas bans at the moment, though we may be right at the tipping point.

Stakeholder Input Survey Summary (Lisa Choi, NYSHCR; Mikhail Haramati, NYSERDA; and Jodi Smits Anderson, DASNY)

Presentation by Lisa Choi, NYSHCR

- Developed qualitative survey to solicit input from stakeholders
 - Respondents can propose up to 5 top ideas/recommendations for policy and action
- Demographic information
 - Survey open from 10/30/20-12/2/20, disseminated by Advisory Panel members to key stakeholders
 - 65 unique respondents with broad distribution across building sectors, though no representatives from labor and approx. 1/2 of responses from private sector
 - See slides 16-22 for more details

Presentation by Mikhail Haramati, NYSERDA

- Policy Action responses
 - Regulations (includes codes, appliance standards, mandates, rate changes)
 - Equity in Planning and Implementation (includes LMI and Disadvantaged Communities focus)
 - See slides 23-26 for more in-depth summary of responses
- Clarifications and Questions
 - **Jodi:** Once survey responses were received, is there any group or targeted audience that we did not get sufficient responses from?
 - **Simon McDonnell:** Did not receive input from labor representation. Plan is to put together summary memo of survey responses to circulate to advisory panel members.
 - **Clarke:** Public engagement is at the heart of the CLCPA process. Panel should revisit how to solicit additional input.

Presentation by Jodi Smits Anderson, DASNY

- Word clouds from responses (see graphic on slide 27): Did not see very much information about resilience or adaptation. Perhaps this is an opportunity that is being missed to gain more traction with policy work, given immediacy of quick recovery, disasters, and health issues. Do we need to look more at behavior change/science or are we comfortable with regulations doing most of the work on this effort?
 - **Sadie:** Including disaster recovery-type programs – could make one standard for decarbonization/electrification that includes resilient features without having a separate resilient buildings scope. The way to include it is to not to call it separate, but integrate key elements into our discussion on an overall approach to electrification and decarbonization.
 - **Daphany:** What’s the investment in electrification and developing microgrids for LMI households? Mitigation of extreme heat and cold snaps, etc. need to be integrated into determining best approaches and accounting for those benefits in evaluating project cost-effectiveness. HCR has done extensive research on resiliency aspect on housing and buybacks and insurance dynamics.
 - **Jodi:** Resilience, health, and recoverability as an important part of messaging. Will having conversations around these benefits in the case of flooding/health concerns enable things to be tied into policy conversation around regulating gas use.
 - **Jamal:** Are we talking about people or buildings? Enable buildings to be resilient to or respond better to disruptions and impacts on energy systems. If we’re talking about people, resiliency can be a negative in that for someone to have to be “resilient” for an extended period of time, this can have costly impacts on health. Thinking about long-term stress disorder as a reaction to events that might occur. Need to ensure messaging is clear about resiliency/adaptation of built environment and flipping messaging so that people don’t have to be as resilient as we’ve had to be for so long, especially in DACs.
 - **Jin Jin:** Surprised that in survey responses, resiliency does not pop up. End users are concerned about cost, equity, EE in front of them. Resiliency has to be considered from utility/regulatory perspective.
 - **Bill:** Assume a number of respondents were homeowners and renters.
 - **Sadie:** Would be fascinating to survey this group of people to understand the homes they live in. Many of us are not living in circumstances that represent what we’re aspiring for.
 - **Daphany:** As someone who lives in public housing, we face significant challenges here in electrifying.

Resilience and Climate Adaptation (Rachel Wieder, NYSHCR)

- Brought together three experts on resiliency and adaptation to discuss, including:
 - Mark Lowery, DEC
 - Barbara Kendall, DOS
 - Amanda Stevens, NYSERDA

Community Risk and Resiliency Act (Mark Lowery, DEC)

- Reference slides 31-41 for detailed information, including flood risk in New York, an overview of the Community Risk and Resiliency Act (2014) and guidance docs, state flood risk management guidance, general flood-risk management guidelines, and options for local adoption of SFRMG guidelines.

Using Model Local Laws to Increase Resilience (Barbara Kendall, DOS)

- Reference slides 42-52 for detailed information, including an overview of DOS model local laws: encourage building elevation, requirements for elevated buildings, mitigate nonconforming uses, improve flood damage prevention law, allow for temporary structures.

Adapting Buildings for a Changing Climate (Amanda Stevens, NYSERDA)

- Reference slides 53-64 for detailed information, including impacts of extreme temperatures, the energy efficiency/climate resilience nexus, urban heat island mitigation through building adaptations, and complementary strategies for energy conservation and adaptation measures.

Summary/Q&A

- **Clarke:** What are some drivers at local level to encourage adoption of green/cool roofs?
 - **Amanda:** Ways to integrate ventilation into existing buildings instead of just designing from scratch. For green/cool roofs, NYC may have a driver for this through energy reduction goals. Many policy drivers that could be considered here.
- **Daphany:** Often when we talk about climate resiliency and mitigation vs. adaptation, we talk about it in terms of impacts (flooding, extreme heat), but these don't work in a silo. Is there research that shows layering climate vulnerabilities on top of each other in a specific geographic region to determine how to prioritize comprehensive climate mitigation/adaptation strategies moving forward. Example: Certain buildings in NYC with high senior population concentrates many climate vulnerabilities in one region. Central Brooklyn region badly affected by Sandy with a wide mix of demographics but no flood impacts. How to prioritize and take these factors into consideration?
- **Jamal:** Are there specific ways for multifamily to increase resilience? Are there specific materials that can get at that?
- **Barbara:** A lot of opportunities for new buildings to consider impacts.
- **Heather Spitzberg:** When we have buildings that need to meet flood requirements, we often eliminate units on the first floor.
- **Mark Lowery:** Census tracts show substantial differences in vulnerabilities at lower level.
- **Bill:** Current Great Lakes sea level rise projections?
 - **Mark:** SLR will not impact the Lakes.
- **Bill:** Concerned about heat waves on health, UHI effect, etc. Solutions often leave out how we're approaching electrification. Air source heat pumps do not reduce stress on grid. Ground source heat pumps minimize peak demand impacts during heat waves.
- **Sadie:** Developers don't really want to build in flood zones. Existing homes in flood zones – rather than just create a program for building elevation in existing homes, should create a more

comprehensive program that incorporates both energy and resiliency. Add-on to an energy-related program, not a standalone.

Work Plan Updates and Schedule for 2021

- See slides 65-68 for additional details for the December schedule, an overview of January through March 2021, and other key reminders.

Q&A and Chat

- *Bill Nowak*: More on Gas Bans - Oakland and San Jose, California Join San Francisco, Berkeley, etc. in banning the installation of natural gas in new construction. By ANNIE SCIACCA | asciaccia@bayareanewsgroup.com | Bay Area News Group - December 2, 2020 - Oakland joined dozens of California cities Tuesday in passing an ordinance to ban gas stoves and heaters in new buildings yet to be constructed throughout the city. The City Council unanimously decided to prohibit newly constructed buildings — both residential and commercial — from connecting to natural gas or propane.
- *Bill Nowak*: The ordinance, introduced by council members Dan Kalb and Nikki Fortunato Bas and Mayor Libby Schaaf, does not apply to existing buildings and any associated renovations or additions. Neither does it affect attached accessory dwelling units. Although the law requires new buildings to be equipped with all-electric power sources, it does allow developers to apply for waivers if they believe that isn't feasible. And Seattle Mayor Jenny Durkan announced a proposal to update the city's energy code to ban the use of fossil fuels, aka natural gas, in new commercial and large multi-family construction for space and most water heating.
- *Richard Fennelly*: Require that commercial refrigeration owners (foodservice & healthcare) do preventative maintenance, such as coil cleaning, for both indirect emissions reduction and better safety for the inventory in the "coolers". For NYC, we estimate a cut of ~1.95 mt/yr in emissions at full market penetration. It's akin to auto emissions/inspection requirements. Owners now widely resist doing it. Many other behavior barriers also from the HVACR trade.
- *Richard Fennelly*: Rocky Mountain Institute is funding a Global Cooling Prize which is great, but they are ignoring maintenance which is unfortunate.
- *Elizabeth Kelly*: Why isn't energy benchmarking listed in the list of potential policies?
- *Bob Wyman*: In Massachusetts, both Brookline and Arlington passed gas bans, but the State Attorney General says that State law preempts these efforts. Brookline has just agreed to petition the Massachusetts legislature for explicit authority to ban fossil fuel infrastructure: <https://www.eenews.net/stories/1063720135>.
- *Bob Wyman*: For history of "bans" in New York, folk should remember that New York City recently banned #6 fuel oil for heating and has scheduled a ban on #4 oil for 2030. Additionally, some years ago, the state banned normal #2 fuel oil for heating and required that ultra-low sulfur diesel be used in its place.
- *Bob Wyman*: The Netherlands, one of Europe's largest gas providers, has announced that gas will be removed from buildings by 2050. They have begun a process of identifying "gas-less neighbourhoods" which will be disconnected from gas, on schedule, in future years. See: <https://energypost.eu/a-revolution-the-netherlands-kisses-gas-goodbye-but-will-it-help-the-climate/>.
- *Bob Wyman*: In the Netherlands: "Currently every house or residence is still legally entitled to a connection to the gas grid. This law will be annulled and replaced by a "right to a heating connection". New houses will not be connected to the gas grid anymore in any case. The 7 million existing houses will be gradually disconnected from the gas grid."

- *Irene Weiser*: See too this linked list of local laws banning gas use in new buildings <https://lpdd.org/pathway/natural-gas-bans-in-new-buildings/>.
- *Brian Cregan*: Have actual homeowners been interviewed at all in this process?
- *Daphany Sanchez*: I think we'd need a cost & risk analysis for specific regions to determine the cost to electrification, climate disaster projections, the cost of mitigation vs. adaptation.
- *Richard Fennelly*: Don't forget buildings that are not homes --- commercial and institutional buildings are critical too.
- *Joel Etter*: Battle reignites over first East Coast gas bans: https://www.eenews.net/stories/1063720135?mkt_tok=eyJpIjoiTjJJeVlXTmhaamhrTURBMSIsInQiOiJ1ZGQ0YjdmXC9oWXVmZW4xa2pwU3JLdmYxb2ZcL0J3eVlVmOFRIZjZwcUZndU15MUJ3b0x6MjNReTVhMXdWYnJLMW9ZbWE3eTMzeEppS0FmODFxdGNVVDgydlc0M1R5UE1lU2RjZkZkOVJ1eVpidTVnTGgydFwvMDIIRThiSU5iUmxaRSJ9.
- *Brian Cregan*: Thanks - for the feedback to my question. Homeowners are the people who will decide if EE happens or not - so talking to them seems important to me.
- *Richard Fennelly*: If any building has a window AC unit, that's a huge source of unneeded electric waste.
- *Irene Weiser*: So, installer education, quality control, and consumer protection important to incorporate into strategies too.
- *Clarke Gocker*: Agree with that Irene.
- *Bob Wyman*: <http://ap.buffalo.edu/adapting-buildings>.
- *Daphany Sanchez*: <https://www1.nyc.gov/site/dep/water/green-infrastructure-grant-program.page>.
- *Bob Wyman*: Air source heat pumps also produce winter peak demand which is multiples of that produced by geothermal heat pumps. We can't afford to build enough electrical capacity to support high penetrations of air source heat pumps. On the other hand, we can support geothermal heat pumps with reasonable investments.