

# CJWG Meeting Minutes

## WebEx - 11.16.22

### Meeting Commence 3:00pm

*Disclaimer: \*Please note this is not a word for word translation.*

### Agenda:

1. Vote to approve Minutes
2. Review last Meeting and Next Steps
3. Discuss and Review the revised timeline
4. Discussion
5. Next Steps

### Panelists/Attendees:

- Alanah Keddell-Tuckey, EJ Director, Office of Environmental Justice, DEC
- Adriana Espinoza, Deputy Commissioner for Equity and Justice, DEC
- Jill Henck, Clean Energy Program Director, (ANCA) Adirondack North Country Association
- Chris Coll, Director of Energy Affordability and Equity Program, NYSERDA
- Sameer Ranade, Climate Justice Advisor with Climate Action Council
- Sonal Jessel, Policy, and Advocacy Coordinator, WEACTION for Environmental Justice
- Jill Henck, Clean Energy Program Director, (ANCA) Adirondack North Country Association
- Alex Dunn, Director, Illume Advising
- Elizabeth Furth, Fellow, Executive, DEC
- Andrea Linton, Public Participation Specialist, Office of Communication Services, DEC
- Eddie Bautista, Executive Director, NYC Environmental Justice Alliance
- Maria Katchmar, Environmental Program Specialist, Office of Communication Services, (DEC)
- Abigail McHugh-Grifa, Executive Director, Climate Solutions Accelerator of the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region
- Neil Muscatiello, Director of the Bureau of Environmental and Occupational Epidemiology, Center for Environmental Health, DOH

**Approval of minutes** -There was a quorum. CJWG members voted and approved last meeting's minutes.

### **Workplan and timeline: Adriana**

- Consensus to vote in Feb 2023
- Will have two meetings in both November and December 2022
- In 2023 Alanah will send out a new survey for best meeting times
- Goal for January 2023 is two-three meetings

- Goal of three meetings in February is to reach consensus then have a final vote
- Final criteria deadline March 2023
- Alanah will send around a timeline

**Abigail:** If we approve in February how does that affect the timeline for program eligibility changing? Would be helpful to have clarity.

**Alanah:** The goal is to have things go into effect immediately so agencies and entities can apply it.

**Chris:** Agencies, authorities and entities are required by law to ensure communities are receiving 35 percent of benefits and investments. In our last meeting we discussed revisiting benefits and investments going to DACs. Perhaps this is a good time to discuss what that means. How are agencies applying the criteria?

**Abigail:** Thanks Chris. That would be helpful.

#### **DACs Comments Discussion- Alex**

- We received 3,124 comments and collapsed them down.
- 10% of comments had geographic information.
- We've identified 66 individual indicators recommended for inclusion.
- We are already identifying data for diabetes.

#### **Breakdown of 66 individual indicators:**

- previously considered any of them
  - -yes 34 (therefor dismissed)
  - -no 27
  - -partial 5

**Eddie:** Which categories should we pay attention to? Can you speak to the methodology comments.

**Alex:** There was a lot of discussion about block groups versus census tracts. Should we be using buffer zones or not? We should definitely discuss the possibility of using either and how we weigh these criteria.

**Abigail:** Is the ground truthing pointing to tracts folks wanted included? What overlap was there between questions about indicators that should have been included?

**Alex:** We have not done analysis of characteristics yet. We'd like to do overlap and then look closer at characteristics beneath that.

**Eddie:** Some comments pressed for more racial justice. Do folks understand the concept of EJ or climate justice? We are targeting specific ways inclusivity plays out in NY.

**Alex:** We saw comments in support and against including race, economics, and population characteristics. There was a balance in comment topics.

**Areas that need a bigger discussion:**

- Comment: use of area median income versus state median income
- Comment: gentrification how to measure it
- Comment: unintended policy vulnerabilities

**Jill:** Question about the energy burden. At what point are we updating the data? Jill is thinking of increased fuel costs from summer 2022.

**Alex:** We are not able to tell until maybe in 2023. There is a big methodology concern. How are we reincorporating primary heating fuels? They were considered as an indicator but dismissed because they were not informing much or adding much to the conversation.

**Review of indicators for working group to review closely and discuss:**

- eg) concentration of heat vulnerable jobs
- eg) flooding indicators
- eg) vehicle access
- eg) vegetation tree canopy and green space
- eg) rainfall

**Methodological recommendations: Alex**

Thresholds for tracts with eligible households

eg) re-evaluate diesel fuel

eg) re-evaluate separation of race variables

**Chris:** Remind us please. Is there an easy way to remove an indicator from the methodology? How much does that shift the criteria? Can we do that. Yes or no?

**Alex:** We have previously for old draft criteria.

**Alanah:** The goal is to create deliverables for working group so we know exactly what we are talking about to stay on track for 2023.

**Alex:** The goal is to have running list of what is needed from the working group and what Illume is working on simultaneously. Policy and gentrification we cannot fix by Feb 2023. Not possible in the timeframe.

**Abigail:** NY state versus area choice was made because basically that is what is already being used for programs correct?

**Chris:** In actual criteria there are community level indicators such as HUD. On top of that we included low-income households for accounting purposes. Since this data already exists, it is helpful.

**Alex:** Alex will work with Alanah to get an excel spreadsheet out to the CJWG for their input. An additional list outlining what is needed from the CJWG and what Illume and DEC are working on will be compiled. Both lists will be put on SharePoint.

**Abigail:** Is there an analysis the state did of the CCIA (Climate and Community Investment Act)? What are the limitations of the CCIA? Does an analysis exist and can we get access to it?

**Alanah:** Alanah will follow up.

*No further comments/concerns from working group*

### **Next Steps**

- Organize for next few CJWG meetings
- Close the loop on our outstanding issues eg) ACLIMA Pro meetings setup coming from our Air Team.
- Meet internally to discuss organization of next few meetings
- Create list of deliverables for our next few meetings
- All will be uploaded to SharePoint by end of week deadline.
- Next CJWG meeting 11/30/22

**End: 4:25pm**