

Power Generation Advisory Panel Meeting

September 16, 2020

Meeting Notes

Attendees

John Rhodes*
Corinne DiDomenico
Annel Hernandez
Betta Broad
Cecilio Aponte III
Darren Suarez
Emilie Nelson
Jenn Schneider
John Reese
Kit Kennedy
Laurie Wheelock
Shyam Mehta
Bill Acker
Lisa Dix
Rory Christian
Stephan Roundtree

Not in Attendance

All Panel Members were in attendance.

Introductions & Panel Member Priorities

Bill Acker (NY Battery and Energy Storage)

1. Creating an effective electricity system with very high renewables, reliable and cost-effective system.
2. Identifying and planning system needs
3. Peaker plant replacement and pathway to do so, the need to solve our multi-day generation gap issues (longer duration storage etc.).
4. We have redone power generation, but the system looks the same.
5. Transmission discussion needs to be broadened.
6. Energy storage and flexible load management needs to be a component.
7. Economic model and the market place.

Cecilio Aponte (Origination at sPower)

1. Project siting and engaging the communities (coordinating with ag and land use panels).
2. Transmission and interconnection project pipelines.
3. Carbon pricing and how do we create the right market conditions.

Rory Christian (Concentric Consulting)

1. Developing markets that will incentivize the right kind of development (low-carbon and no-carbon).
2. Downstate region and increasing equity of projects (reducing peaker plants downstate).

Betta Broad (New Yorkers for Clean Power).

1. Community engagement in the transition.
2. Encouraging workforce opportunities.
3. Education in schools about the CLCPA and renewable energy.
4. No new gas infrastructure, ending peaker plants.
5. Identification of barriers in the transition and how to address them.

Lisa Dix (Sierra Club).

1. Addressing barriers to siting for LSR.
2. Project siting for 6 GW distributed solar target.
3. EE targets for utilities.
4. Energy conservation, Battery storage, including building and siting it, particularly for Zones J and K.
5. Creative uses for fossil fuel power plant sites so we can create a new system for NYC/LI and ensure equity.
6. Transition plan for oil and gas in the electric sector. No new gas or repowering old plants with gas.

Annel Hernandez (NYC EJA)

1. Peaker plant displacement, the 16 NYC Peakers should be prioritized for shutdown.
2. Continued momentum for localized DER projects in communities, especially for low income communities. Incentives and removal of barriers.
3. LSR – intentional about community benefits and workforce development opportunities.
4. Protecting and utilizing industrial waterfronts and turn them into hubs for the renewable energy transition in the city.

Kit Kennedy (NRDC)

1. *How* to meet goals on time and fully and smoothly
2. Create as many co-benefits as we go - Successfully hitting equity goals, including reduction of air pollution, and workforce development/community sustainability.
3. Working across different Advisory Panels.

Shyam Mehta (NYSIA)

1. Distributed generation (solar and storage).
2. “Low hanging fruit” policy changes with low financial requirements.
3. Master plan for proactive distribution investments to improve the distribution grid.
4. Interconnection.
5. Standardizing property tax (slows down deployment of solar).
6. Compensation for DER - Improving VDER tariff to better reflect the SCC and benefits from avoided transmission from DERs and the price of carbon.
7. NYC access to community solar – how to increase? Consider allowing cross utility crediting.

Emilie Nelson (NYISO)

1. Preserving reliability.
2. Leveraging competitive markets and new technologies.
3. Leveraging NYISO studies and expertise.

John Reese (Eastern Generation)

1. Intersection between policy and market implementation.
2. Cost of achieving goals
3. Addressing building infrastructure barriers
4. Reliability
5. Any analysis shows we need 20% magic. How do we get the last 20% (biogas, hydrogen, or another way?). Need technology development.

Stephan Roundtree (Vote Solar)

1. Create market conditions to drive clean energy.
2. Transition away from fossil generation and peakers in EJ communities.
3. Maximize positive and just outcomes.

Jenn Schneider (IBEW)

1. Upgrading of the transmission system.
2. Education for communities who are receiving projects (may look different than they thought).
3. Just transition, equitable pay, job creation in construction *and* operations & maintenance of the system.

Darren Suarez (Boralex)

1. Competitive markets.
2. Transmission.
3. Regional collaboration and interconnections.
4. How to link upstate renewables and OSW.
5. Consider things that are outside NY's control.

Laurie Wheelock (Public Utility Law Project)

1. How to get clean energy to LMI communities.
2. Keep clean solutions affordable.
3. Workforce development.
4. Engaging communities in the process.
5. Reliability of the grid.

State of the Sector

See Slides. Covered CLCPA goals, progress so far, the Accelerated Renewable Energy Growth and Community Benefit Act, Clean Energy Standard Expansion (to align with CLCPA, White Paper has been submitted for comment).

- John Reese: Are the LSR projects “in the pipeline” based on real projects and do we have an attrition rate? Response: Yes, based on real projects. Unsure if this is based on pre- or post-attrition.

Pathways Presentation – E3

See slides (E3 available for follow-up with Panel Members)

- Annel Hernandez: concerned about the reliance on hydrogen, RNG, and CCS. No evidence that this is ready technology and an effective solution. Need to move towards complete shutdown of peakers, not repowering.

- Bill Acker: Is there an analysis with longer duration storage for firm capacity. Response: yes, 4-and 8-hour storage was used, longer term storage was not analyzed.
- Emilie Nelson: Important points on location of resources and ability to serve load. Need for different types of technology, which may change by community. Not sure that we have to define what type of technology that is, but our recommendations should allow for innovation and creativity to meet those needs.
- Cecilio Aponte: Have you looked at 2050 weather patterns and how this will impact the grid? Response: E3 has not looked at this, but the Panel should take the science into consideration.

Work Plan Development Discussion

Scope Development Discussion (See slides)

- Lisa Dix: What's our process of agreement? Interaction and dialogue is key. How do we do that? Response: That's up to us. Consensus is key once we reach our recommendations, but the process to get there is improved if we don't have consensus at the start.
- Bill Acker: Approaching the work by topic makes sense. There is a broader set of issues to transmission, should be refined to "energy delivery"
- Kit Kennedy: Looks like good list of topics. Do we explore all of the topics on Slide 20 and information share to help build recommendations? What is the process to address these topics and develop the strategies? Response: It is up to the group, but this is the process that we assumed. We will have to move quickly though. Kit: There needs to be a matrix for what we find out in each of these topics to assemble and create a recommendation. I can help lead the process development. Darren can work with Kit on the process.
- Betta Broad: Great start of list, but given the amount of time that we have in meetings and the fact that we need to move quickly, should we create subcommittees to dive into the topics? What are the priorities/order of addressing? Response: We need to have process developed by next meeting, engaging by email to continue to work on the processes and topics. Internal staff could help make that possible.
 - General: Need to go through and flush out topics.
 - Annel Hernandez: Share document that has short description and key questions for each topic.
 - General: Agreement on that approach
 - Emilie Nelson: Identify leads of sub-committees? But wary of creating bureaucracy that gets in the way. Maybe have leads on topics that would host a discussion with the full group able to attend (attend if you are interested, but open to full group)
 - Lisa Dix: Need agreement on how the sub-committees are working together and how the process reaches agreement on goals/priorities and resolves differences. What is the role of the Working group? Are they able to help facilitate?
 - Resources: Agency staff working group, E3, consultant for facilitation, coming online now.

- Annel Hernandez: Can we create a shared document for the group on the various topics, along with questions and assumptions?
- Laurie Wheelock: Need shared documents and place to collect information.

Timeline (See Slides)

- John Reese: Will there be analysis resources available? Response: Yes, through E3 and Agency Staff.

Next Steps

- We should calendar out the next 6 months.
- Panel will continue to work on the processes and topics and answering the Next Steps: For Discussion slide questions.