Meeting Procedures

Before beginning, a few reminders to ensure a smooth discussion:

> Panel members should be on mute if not speaking.

  > If using phone for audio, please tap the phone mute button.

  > If using computer for audio, please click the mute button on the computer screen (1st visual).

> Video is encouraged for Panel members, in particular when speaking.

> In the event of a question or comment, please use the hand raise function (2nd visual). You can get to the hand raise button by clicking the participant panel button (3rd visual). The chair will call on members individually, at which time please unmute.

> If technical problems arise, please contact [Hand Raise](#) You'll see [hand with white tick] when your microphone is muted
Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act
Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel

September 24, 2020
1:00pm – 3:00pm EST
Meeting 1

Sarah Crowell, LULGAP Chair
New York State Department of State
Meeting Agenda

- Welcome, Agenda Review, Introductions
- CLCPA Primer
- Advisory Panel Work Plan
- State of Sector
- Scope Development Discussion
- Next Steps
- Adjournment
Land Use and Local Government Panel Members

Sarah Crowell, Chair
Director, Office of Planning, Devt, & Community Infrastructure: DOS

Mark Lowery
Assistant Director, Office of Climate Change: DEC

Jessica Bacher
Managing Director: Pace University School of Law Land Use Law Center

Jayme Breschard-Thomann
Senior Project Manager, Bergmann PC

Kevin Law
President & CEO: Long Island Association

Katie Malinowski
Executive Director: NYS Tug Hill Commission

Ed Marx
Former Commissioner of Planning: Tompkins County

Kathy Moser
Senior Vice President: Open Space Institute

Priya Mulgaonkar
Resiliency Planner: New York City Environmental Justice Alliance

Gita Nandan
Board Chair: RETI (Resilience, Education, Training and Innovation) Center

Juan Camilo Osorio
Assistant Professor: Pratt Institute School of Architecture

Eric Walker
Climate and Clean Energy Strategist

Supported by a Multi-Agency Staff Working Group
Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act (CLCPA) – Overview

Carbon neutral economy, mandating at least an 85% reduction in emissions below 1990 levels
40% reduction in emissions by 2030
100% zero-carbon electricity by 2040
70% renewable electricity by 2030
9,000 MW of offshore wind by 2035
6,000 MW of distributed solar by 2025
3,000 MW of energy storage by 2030
185 TBtu on-site energy savings by 2025

Commitments to climate justice and just transition
Delivering the CLCPA

**COUNCIL**

- **CONVENE GROUPS**
  - Convene Advisory Panels and Just Transition Working Group

- **DRAFT THE PLAN**
  - Draft the Scoping Plan, develop and consider Advisory Panel and Just Transition Working Group recommendations, stakeholder input, consult Climate Justice and Environmental Justice groups

- **ISSUE DRAFT PLAN**
  - Issue Draft Scoping Plan

- **HOLD PUBLIC HEARINGS**
  - on Draft Scoping Plan

- **DELIVER FINAL PLAN**
  - Approve and adopt Final Scoping Plan, deliver to Governor and Legislature

**AGENCIES**

- **2020**
  - Working Group
    - Convene Climate Justice Working Group (DEC)

- **2021**
  - Rule Making & Guidance
    - Emission Limit Rulemaking & Value of Carbon Guidance (DEC, NYSERDA)

- **2022**
  - Working Group
    - Disadvantaged Communities Criteria (Climate Justice Working Group)

  - Report
    - Annual GHG Emissions (DEC)

  - Program
    - Community Air Monitoring Program (DEC)

**Programs**
- Renewable Energy Programs Established (PSC, NYSERDA)

- **2023**
  - Report
    - Annual GHG Emissions (DEC)

- **2024**
  - Report
    - Annual GHG Emissions (DEC)

  - Regulations
    - based on Scoping Plan (DEC)
Advisory Panels and Working Groups

Six Advisory Panels:

> **Sectors:** Transportation, Agriculture/Forestry, Land Use/Local Government, Power Generation, Housing/Energy Efficiency, Energy Intensive/Trade Exposed Industries.

> Chaired by Climate Action Council Commissioner or designee.

> Advisory Panel to determine scope of work, within the emissions sector.

Just Transition Working Group:

> Co-Chaired by Commissioner of Labor and President & CEO of NYSERDA; includes Commissioner of Housing and Community Renewal and Chair of the Public Service Commission.

> Scope of work includes jobs report, workforce training needs, power plant site reuse opportunities.

Climate Justice Working Group

> First meeting on August 14, 2020
Directions to the Council

> Adopt a scoping plan of recommendations for achieving GHG limits
> Recommend measures to achieve the GHG limits, including carbon neutral economy
> Evaluate the costs and benefits, both economic and non-economic and including co-benefits, of the measures for reducing GHGs
> Identify measures to maximize reductions of both GHGs and co-pollutants in disadvantaged communities

Process

> Receive recommendations from advisory panels, Just Transition Working Group
> Consult with Climate Justice Working Group and Environmental Justice Advisory Group
> Hold 6 public comment hearings on the draft scoping plan
> Update every 5 years
Scoping Plan Contents

At a minimum:
> Performance-based standards for GHG sources
> Reducing electricity sector emissions, advancing achievement of the clean energy requirements
> Limiting use of synthetic GHGs
> Land-use and transportation planning
> Reducing energy use in existing residential or commercial buildings
> Achieving long-term carbon sequestration
> Promoting best management practices in land use
> Aiding in the transition of the state workforce to the clean energy economy
> Limiting emission leakage
Timeline to Draft Scoping Plan

- **Climate Action Council Mtgs**
- **Advisory Panels**
- **Climate Action Council**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>2020</th>
<th>2021</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Aug</td>
<td>Sep</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Work Plan</td>
<td>Recommendations Development and Outreach</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integration Analysis</td>
<td>Review Draft Integrated Strategy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Inter-agency Work Product/Deliberative/Not Subject to FOIL
Do Not Distribute
Advisory Panel Work Plan
Land Use and Local Government Panel
Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel Objectives

> Develop recommendations for achieving greenhouse gas reductions (mitigation strategies with detailed actions) through land use and local government actions by March 2021

> Define supporting initiatives needed to enable or magnify the recommended mitigation strategies by March 2021

> Collaborate with other advisory panels to identify sector-specific strategies for which land use and local government actions play a supporting role and develop corresponding recommendations and supporting initiatives

> Develop recommendations for short-term actions to support community climate change adaptation and resilience, and long-term actions to support statewide, comprehensive adaptation and resilience
Land Use and Local Government Advisory Panel Possible Primary Focus Areas

> Local Education and Capacity Building
> Reduction of Vehicle-Miles-Traveled
> Comprehensive Planning and Zoning
> Adoption of Energy Stretch Codes
> Government Procurement
> Community Choice Aggregation
> Community Power
> Blue Carbon Management
> Community Adaptation and Resilience
Adaptation and Resilience

The LULG Advisory Panel will:

> In consultation with all sectoral advisory panels, identify policies, programs or actions necessary to adapt to the impacts of climate change and increase resilience statewide.
  • One member from each advisory panel will participate in one or more meetings led by the LULG panel on the topic of climate adaptation and resilience.
  • The LULG panel will collect and compile input from each of the advisory panels regarding climate change adaptation and resilience.

> Present a list of comprehensive recommendations for adaptation and resilience to the Climate Action Council to consider for inclusion in the Scoping Plan.
  • Recommendations should include both short-term and long-term actions to support community climate change adaptation and resilience, and long-term actions to support statewide, comprehensive adaptation and resilience.
  • Recommendations may be sector-specific or economy-wide and should reflect the input of all advisory panels.
State of the Sector
Land Use and Local Government Panel

Paul Beyer
New York State Department of State

Brad Tito
New York State Energy, Research & Development Authority
Location Efficiency

Smart Land-Use Planning and Zoning Reduces Vehicle Miles Travelled (VMT) by Creating “Location Efficiency”

**Smart Growth**
- Compact
- Mixed-use
- Walkable/bikable
- Transit-accessible
- Ample public and open space
- Mix of Housing Options
- Age Accessible

**Transit-Oriented Development**
- Smart growth around rail or bus
- Walkable/bikable within a quarter or half mile of transit hub

**Local Tools**
- Comprehensive Plans
- Area Master Plans
- Zoning Tools (overlay, form-based, incentive)
- Promoting inclusivity, affordability, and density
- Open Space
- Priority Growth Area Plans
In 2015, New Rochelle approved the Downtown Overlay Zone (DOZ) covering 279 acres of their downtown. Here's what they're doing right:

• Prepared a developer’s guide to accompany the new form-based code
• Included a series of bonuses in height allowances in exchange for community benefits
• Incentivized developers to build in accordance with the DOZ rather than the underlying zoning regulations.
• Allowed for a mix of uses including residential, office, commercial, and entertainment/cultural arts.
Smart Growth Land-Use Scenario

Multi-family attached dwelling in compact, mixed-use zoning; accessible to transit and/or close to work; LEED-certified; electric, hybrid or fuel-efficient household vehicle; in a Climate-Smart Community (CSC) and/or a Clean Energy Community (CEC); in a jurisdiction with a “stretch” energy code, a comprehensive plan that identifies climate change, clean energy and/or sustainability as goals and a Complete Streets ordinance (in other words, Super-Smart Growth).
Vehicle Miles Traveled
Other Contributing Factors

- POP. GROWTH
- ECONOMIC ACTIVITY
- FUEL PRICES
- REGIONAL DIFFERENCES
- VEHICLE OWNERSHIP
- COVID-19
Statewide VMT Trends

- Vehicle ownership and driving patterns drive energy use and emissions
  - The number of vehicles within the state is projected to grow with population, but vehicle-miles traveled (VMT) is projected to grow more quickly
- Fuel efficiency improvements, increased public transit, urbanization, and mode shifting to walking/biking are all factors which can reduce VMT and emissions
- As the economy continues to grow, demand for aviation, shipping, rail, and port energy use is projected to increase as well

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PATHWAYS vehicle category</th>
<th>Key growth driver</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Light Duty Autos</td>
<td>EIA VMT forecast based on data from NYSDOT, NYSDEC, with modifications based on Annual Energy Outlook (AEO) data to account for reduced growth beyond 2030</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Light Duty Trucks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium Duty Trucks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heavy Duty Trucks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buses</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aviation</td>
<td>EIA AEO forecasts of transportation demands by fuel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transportation Other*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

VMT forecast by vehicle type (Reference scenario)

*Transportation Other includes other demand not captured in the stock/rollover vehicle categorization, including motorcycles, shipping, recreational boats, and other on-road and non-road demand

VMT forecast benchmarked to NYSDOT through 2050 for MDV/NDV, through 2030 for LDV and through post-2030 growth rate was calibrated to the relationship between the population growth and VMT from the AEO
VMT Reduction Strategies
Smart Growth and Transit

- A variety of smart growth strategies and transportation mode-shifting measures reduce VMT and increase energy demand in transit modalities
  - These are based on analysis of various data sources, including USDOT Moving Cooler report, OneNYC report, data from Citi Bike and CEOs for Cities report
  - Strategies include expanded mass transit, increased density via land use planning, car sharing, mode shifting from cars to walking and biking
- Downstate region is currently more dense and has greater mass transit availability, with greater focus on reducing VMT through mode shifting (walking/biking); through densification and smart growth upstate region can achieve VMT reductions as well

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>VMT reduction strategies included in PATHWAYS analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Smart Growth Strategies (from USDOT Moving Cooler report)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Density</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Destination Accessibility</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

![Graph showing annual VMT (Billion Miles) from 2015 to 2050]
State Programs are currently working with local governments to support a broad range of climate goals, including but not limited to:

- Downtown Revitalization and Smart Growth
- Healthy and Age-Friendly Policies
- Affordable Housing
- Parks and Open Space Protection
- Climate Resilience and Adaption
The Role of Local Government

Local Governments are essential to addressing climate change:

• Codes and Standards
• Government Operations and Infrastructure
• Land-Use and Transportation
• Clean Energy Policies and Projects
• Broad-Based Consumer Demand for Clean Energy
State Energy Programs

State Programs currently working with local governments to specifically address GHG reduction include:

• Clean Energy Communities
• Five Cities Program
• Climate Smart Communities
NYSERDA Clean Energy Communities
Results-to-Date

313 Clean Energy Communities
583 Participating Communities
1,743 High-Impact Actions Completed
NYSERDA High-Impact Actions

1. Benchmarking
2. Clean Energy Upgrades
3. LED Street Lights
4. Clean Fleets
5. Community Campaigns
6. Unified Solar Permit
7. Energy Code Enforcement Training
8. Climate Smart Communities Certification
9. Community Choice Aggregation
10. PACE Financing
Climate Smart Communities

Reach

313 Registered
- Pledged to act on climate
- 8.78 M people since 2009
- 45% of NYS population

62 Certified
- Leaders who have documented progress
- Over 2,000 certification actions completed since 2014
Climate Smart Communities
Pledge Elements

1) Build a Climate Smart Community
2) Inventory Emissions, Set Goals, & Plan for Climate Action
3) Decrease Energy Use
4) Shift to Clean, Renewable Energy
5) Use Climate-smart Materials Management
6) Implement Climate-Smart Land Use
7) Enhance Community Resilience to Climate Change
8) Support a Green Innovation Economy
9) Inform & Inspire the Public
10) Engage in an Evolving Process of Climate Action
How are CSC and CEC Related?

**Climate Smart Communities Certification**
- Comprehensive climate action program
- 100+ unique actions
- Improve score on CSC grant applications

**Clean Energy Communities (NYSERDA)**
- Focused on energy use
- Short list of high-impact actions
  - 1 of 10 is becoming a Certified CSC
- Complete actions to access CEC grants

➢ Earn points toward CSC certification by doing CEC actions
➢ Do both!
NYPA Five Cities Energy Master Plans

ACTION AREAS

**Energy Planning & Coordination**
The Energy Planning & Coordination action area includes goals, objectives and initiatives designed to improve energy procurement and management processes, and foster public-private partnerships and cooperation around clean energy deployment. This action area also contains initiatives around general sustainability and green development that encompass buildings, transportation and infrastructure strategies, and therefore, do not fit neatly into any of the subsequent areas.

**Energy Efficiency in Buildings**
The Energy Efficiency in Buildings action area focuses on improvements to building performance in municipal and private buildings. Strategies include building standards and energy code compliance, improved data collection and reporting, public awareness and education, and innovative financing mechanisms to unlock markets for energy efficiency.

**Transportation Energy Efficiency**
The Transportation Energy Efficiency action area includes a focus on compact and transit-oriented development, congestion reduction strategies, alternative transportation infrastructure, and clean vehicle deployment. The initiatives cover zoning and development standards, public and private fleets, transit, bike and pedestrian infrastructure, and energy-efficient streetlight improvements.

**Energy Distribution & Supply**
The Energy Distribution & Supply action area focuses on clean, distributed energy generation infrastructure, including through the deployment of renewable energy technologies, such as solar PV and microgrid demonstration projects. Similar to the Energy Efficiency in Buildings and Transportation Energy Efficiency action areas, there are initiatives by which the municipalities can lead by example and others to support community action and private-sector investment.
Five Cities Energy Master Plans/Smart Cities Program Progress

- City Energy Plans released in 2015
- Technical staff in place since late 2015
  - Energy Managers
  - Energy Analysts
  - Fellowship Positions
- $2 million in annual savings across all Five Cities
- Installations at >200 locations
- Race to the Top competition complete
SHINING STARS
Communities
Leading the Way

Geneva’s Lake Tunnel Solar Village

Wyandanch/Babylon...A Model TOD

Ulster County’s Climate Smart Communities Model
Geneva: Lake Tunnel Solar Village
Wyandanch/Babylon
A Model TOD

“The fact that Wyandanch, with all of its problems, is the first place on Long Island where you're going to have a major transit-oriented development is amazing...”

- Steve Bellone, Suffolk County Executive
Wall Street Journal, 2013
Geiger Park: Natural Flood Resilience
ULSTER COUNTY
A CLIMATE SMART COMMUNITIES LEADER

• Inter-Agency/Inter-Disciplinary Collaboration
• Ongoing Learning
• Capacity-Building
• Regional, Inter-Governmental Leadership and Support
Scope Discussion
Land Use and Local Government Panel
Next Steps
Land Use and Local Government Panel

Sarah Crowell, LULGAP Chair
New York State Department of State
Advisory Panel Consultation

The LULG Advisory Panel will:

> Meet at least once a month and provide regular updates to the Council on the advancement of its work.
  • Present (oral or written) progress reports at Council meetings and solicit feedback.
  • Provide final recommendations in accordance with the Scoping Plan development schedule.

> Consult with the Climate Justice and Just Transition working groups to inform its recommendations for the Climate Action Council.

> Seek public input to inform the development of recommendations to the Council for consideration.
  • Panels may seek input from selected expertise in a subject area, as determined necessary by the members.
  • Panels shall, during the next six months, hold at least one forum to receive broad-based public input.
  • Provide transparency by making meetings open to public viewing or/and publishing minutes of deliberations.

> Make available information regarding advisory panel public meetings and comment opportunities on the climate.ny.gov webpage.
Next Steps: For Discussion

> Schedule panel meetings
  • Next panel meeting first week of October, monthly meetings until March

> Develop work plan and scope
  • Draft will be circulated before next meeting

> Identify Panel members with specific interest and expertise on defined scope topics/issues

> Identify information needs and sources

> Other Discussion/Questions?