

Transportation Advisory Panel

Meeting 6

December 18, 2020

www.Climate.ny.gov



**Climate Action
Council**

Agenda

- Welcome/Introductions - Commissioner Dominguez/Jared Snyder
- Report out on Climate Action Council Meeting - Commissioner Dominguez/Jared Snyder
- Report out on Climate Justice Work Group - Jared, Nick, Renae
- Report out on Electrification/Fuels Roundtable - Julie Tighe
- Report out on Public Transportation/Smart Growth Round Table - Nick Sifuentes
- Upstate/Downstate Suburban Public Transportation - Bob Zerrillo
- Next Steps - Commissioner Dominguez/Jared Snyder

Meeting Procedures

Before beginning, a few reminders to ensure a smooth discussion:

- Panel members should be on mute when not speaking
- Video is encouraged for Panel members, in particular when speaking
- We will not be muting individuals for this discussion; the chair will call on members individually, at which time please unmute
- If technical problems arise, please contact: jesse.way@cadmusgroup.com

Panel Member Introductions

Transportation Advisory Panel Members

**Marie Therese
Dominguez, Chair**
NYSDOT

Jared Snyder
NYSDEC

Paul Allen, M. J.
Bradley &
Associates

Dimitris Assanis,
Stony Brook
University

Steve Finch, AAA
Western & Central
New York

Albert Gore III, Tesla

Kendra Hems,
Trucking Association
of New York

Elgie Holstein,
Environmental
Defense Fund

Renaë Reynolds,
New York City
Environmental
Justice Alliance

Porie Saikia-Eapen,
Metropolitan Transit
Authority

John Samuelson,
Transport Workers
Union of America
AFL-CIO

Nick Sifuentes,
TriState
Transportation
Campaign

Kerene Tayloe, WE
ACT for
Environmental
Justice

Julie Tighe, NYS
League of
Conservation Voters

Craig Turner, Buffalo
Niagara
International Trade
Gateway
Organization

Nancy Young,
Airlines for America

Bob Zerrillo, New
York Public Transit
Association

Climate Action Council Report Out



Transportation Mitigation Strategies, slide 1 of 4

Scope topic/Subgroup: Transportation Electrification

Strategy under consideration

- Adopt regulatory approaches and supporting policies to increase the sale of M/HD ZEVs to 30% by 2030 and the sale of LD ZEVs to 100% by 2035, and require greater use of ZEV non-road vehicles.

Rationale

- Zero emission vehicles (ZEVs) are rapidly becoming commercially available in many subsectors, offer low lifecycle GHG emissions and zero or low emissions of local pollutants;
- NYS can accelerate this transition to ZEVs through regulatory actions, market-based policies, and supporting activities including incentives, public-private partnerships, and private financing;
- ZEVs save consumers and businesses money otherwise spent on fuels and maintenance.

Equity considerations

- Prioritize M/HD ZEVs in locations impacting overburdened communities (e.g., ports, heavy traffic areas) through strategies such as green zones – these are the largest sources of local air pollution in the transportation sector;
- Focus on making clean transportation available to all, including low-income and rural New Yorkers, through measures such as enhanced incentives, targeted infrastructure investment;
- Avoid transferring pollution from vehicles to peaking power plants located in disadvantaged communities.

Potential Implementation challenges

- The policy levers for this strategy are well established but many require additional resources and financing tools;
- Initial purchase costs of vehicles (esp. M/HD ZEVs) and charging stations, including electric grid upgrades, remain high;
- Policies and programs need to encourage replacement of existing vehicles, open up EV market to more companies;
- Ecosystem improvements require local regulations, workforce training, improving consumer awareness.

Issues to explore

- Suitability of mandates like CA Advanced Clean Trucks, 100% ZEV sales targets, state procurement of non-road vehicles;
- Ways to reduce the cost of EVs through incentives or feebates, used EV rebates, scrappage programs;
- Ways to accelerate charging station installations and bring down their cost;
- Electric tariff changes that encourage off-peak charging, address demand charges, and make EVs more affordable to operate;
- Revenue and financing options, opportunities to create broader economic ecosystem around EVs.

Additional thoughts

- Need for engagement with Power Generation Advisory Panel, Climate Justice WG, Just Transition WG.
- Evaluate market-based mechanisms to reduce carbon emissions and provide longer-term funding for implementation of strategies.
- Evaluate various financing strategies, including Green Bank and other tools to leverage private investment

Transportation Mitigation strategies, slide 2 of 4

Scope topic/Subgroup: Clean Fuels

Strategy under consideration	Adopt a market-based approach and supporting policies to increase the availability and affordability of clean transportation fuels (renewable biofuels, green hydrogen, electricity) in NYS.
Rationale	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Pathways identifies role for diesel substitutes in decarbonizing transportation;• Some hard-to-electrify uses may be decarbonized with low-carbon fuels (e.g. aviation, long-distance trucking);• Potential interim role in other uses as we move towards electrification (e.g. medium/heavy duty trucking).
Equity considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Importance of reducing co-pollutants in overburdened areas, particularly w/r/t diesel truck and bus pollution;• Siting of renewable/clean fuel production, storage and refueling facilities;• Avoid policies and activities that expand fossil fuel infrastructure.
Potential Implementation challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Low Carbon Fuel Standard is a complex regulatory program requiring substantial development; opportunity to partner with other states; potential impact on fuel prices.
Issues to explore	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Availability of various biofuels; best uses for limited availability (with other panels);• Other policy mechanisms to support clean fuels production and deployment;• Interaction with other policies, e.g. LCFS can support electrification;• GHG accounting, including accounting for out-of-state life cycle emissions, including land use impacts.
Additional thoughts	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Consider CLCPA statutory constraints;• Coordinate with Agriculture, Waste Panels and CJWG.

Transportation Mitigation strategies, slide 3 of 4

Scope topic/Subgroup: Public Transportation

Strategy under consideration	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identify policies and programs that would double the availability/accessibility of upstate and downstate suburban public transportation services statewide by 2035; • Identify policies and programs to support system reliability/network expansion projects identified by MTA in their twenty-year needs study.
Rationale	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transportation generates approximately 40 percent of all greenhouse gases, primarily single-occupant light/heavy-duty vehicles; • Unparalleled State support for public transportation directly attributable to New York using the least energy per capita for transportation purposes than any state in the nation; • Results in net reduction of more than 17 million metric tons of carbon annually; • High-frequency/high quality public transportation services provide options to single-occupant vehicles and benefits users/non-users.
Equity considerations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Ensuring affordability of passenger fares/expanding transportation availability/options in rural/underserved communities; • Integrating safe/accessible pedestrian/bicycle infrastructure in un-served/underserved areas; • Reducing carbon emissions in overburdened areas; • Implementing complementary zero-emission public transportation rollingstock/supportive infrastructure/land use considerations.
Potential Implementation challenges	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding and finance strategies to sustain/enhance public transportation services; • COVID-19 revenue loss replenishment needs; • Technological impacts on existing workforce/workforce training and development; • Existing federal rules constrain planning for projects to those activities that are fiscally constrained, conflicts with ambition.
Issues to explore	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Exploring Tax Increment Financing and other revenue strategies to support increased public transportation; • Transitioning performance measures for traditional transportation investments from Level of Service to reduced Vehicle Miles Traveled, Equity, Greenhouse Gas Emissions avoided, health, other. • Incentivizing transit supportive land use/development policies; • Strategies for addressing Last-mile/transit desert connectivity; • Deploying technology that makes transit easier to use.
Additional thoughts	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Requires strong coordination with Land Use and Local Government and Energy Efficiency and Housing Advisory Panels; and Just Transition Working Group. • Evaluate market-based mechanisms to reduce carbon emissions and provide longer-term funding for implementation of strategies.

Transportation Mitigation strategies, slide 4 of 4

Scope topic/Subgroup: Smart Growth and Transportation System Efficiency

Strategy under consideration

- Transportation-Oriented Development—Align roadway, residential and commercial development to be proximate and accessible to public transportation and consider holistic GHG emissions in smart growth developments;
- Low- and Zero-Carbon Transportation Modes—Expand access to low- or zero-carbon transportation modes (biking, walking, carpooling) for first mile/last mile connections to transit and destinations.

Rationale

- Expansion of transit is ideal opportunity to align development and low- or zero-carbon transportation options;
- Well-considered development and provision of appropriate transportation options leads to land use/transportation location efficiencies that support efficient VMT and reduce transportation-based and other greenhouse gas emissions.

Equity considerations

- Overcome the spatial mismatch between housing and jobs for LMI households, which traditionally spend more time and percentage of income on commuting;
- Ensure affordable housing in and around transportation-oriented developments;
- Provide low- or zero-carbon transportation modes that are accessible and affordable for LMI households;
- Support land uses that account for freight without creating areas with poor air quality.

Potential Implementation challenges

- Greater level of inter-governmental land use/transportation coordination, private sector engagement, and local buy-in (through land use planning and zoning), particularly for more compact, mixed-use, mixed-income development;
- Incentives and technical support will likely be needed to achieve local buy-in;
- Financial support may be needed to roll out new transportation options in smaller cities and towns.

Issues to explore

- Mechanisms and opportunities for delivering land use/transportation coordination on this level, mechanisms for delivering new transportation modes in diverse settings;
- Ways to designate local/county/regional priority growth areas that are aligned with public transportation investments;
- Ways to support projects that improve safety and ease of use of low- or zero-carbon transportation modes;
- Changes to SEQRA process to remove barriers to transportation-oriented development while maintaining community input.

Additional thoughts

- Collaborate with Land Use and Transportation Advisory Panel to ensure adequate local land use support.

Discussion

Climate Justice Work Group Report Out



Discussion

Electrification/Fuels Roundtable Report Out



Discussion

Public Transportation/Smart Growth Roundtable Report Out



Discussion

Upstate/Downstate Suburban Public Transportation





Statewide Public Transportation

Bob Zerrillo, Policy Director
NEW YORK PUBLIC TRANSIT ASSOCIATION

December 2020

www.nytransit.org

NYS Transit Systems

- **Regional Transportation Authorities** – MTA, NFTA, RGRTA, CNYRTA, CDTA
- **Downstate County Bus Systems** – Nassau, Westchester, Suffolk, Rockland, Orange, Putnam, Dutchess
- **Upstate Small Urban Areas** – Binghamton, Ithaca, Elmira, Glens Falls, Kingston, Watertown
- **Upstate Rural Counties** – 32 rural counties with transit service

Transit Rankings by Fleet Size

1. **New York MTA**
2. Chicago
3. New Jersey Transit
4. Los Angeles
5. San Francisco
6. Washington, DC
7. **New York Upstate/Downstate Transit
(over 3,000 transit vehicles)**
8. Boston
9. Philadelphia

Transit Ridership and Vehicles

Upstate and Downstate Transit Systems 2019 Unlinked Trips and Fleet

Transit System	Daily Trips	Number of Vehicles
CDTA	51,462	325
CNYRTA (Syracuse)	34,865	289
RGRTA (Total)	52,507	401
NFTA	82,878	435
Binghamton	6,467	70
Ithaca	14,407	81
Rest of Upstate (approx.)	15,000	175
Total Upstate	257,586	1,776
Nassau	79,530	398
Westchester	91,055	437
Suffolk	14,308	360
Dutchess	2,919	52
Rockland	5,163	71
Rest of Downstate (approx.)	30,000	400
Total Downstate	222,975	1,718
Total Upstate and Downstate Transit	480,561	3,494

Non-MTA Transit Systems

Types of Urban and Rural Services

- Light Rail
- Fixed Route Bus
- Bus Rapid Transit
- Express Bus
- Demand Response
- Route Deviation
- Paratransit
- Microtransit
- Regional/Commuter/Intercity





Transit Suppliers Map

Transit Means
JOBS!

For more information, visit the New York Public Transit Association online at www.nytransit.org



Businesses all over NY contribute to the public transit industry and provide thousands of jobs.



Cummins, Inc.
Albany, Saratoga, Sullivan and Armstrong, NY
LIF-Tech equipment
LIFC projects



Seifert Transit Graphics
Oriskany NY
Contract NYCT M&E

These New York State businesses play a crucial role in providing innovative products and services to public transportation and are key contributors to the State's financial health.

ALBANY COUNTY

Atlantic Detroit Diesel-A Allison
Automatic Data Processing
Blue Shield of Northeastern NY
C&S Companies
CDM Smith
CHA
Creighton Manning Engineering
Cummins Northeast, Inc.
Jack M. Reilly & Associates
LUMARR Transit Advertising
Motion Industries Total
Rose & Kiernan, Inc.
Warren Tire

BROOME COUNTY

BAE Systems
Doron Precision Systems, Inc.
Harris Assembly Group
Leonard Bus Sales, Inc.
LIF-Tech Equipment
Mirabito Fuel Group
Westcode Incorporated

BRONX COUNTY

GAL Manufacturing Co. LLC
John Cveteta & Sons Inc.

CAUYAGA COUNTY

Auburn Vacuum Forming Co Inc.

CHAUTAUQUA COUNTY

Empire Bus Sales, LLC

CHEMUNG COUNTY

Empire Bus Sales, LLC

CLINTON COUNTY

Axion Technologies USA
B3CG Interconnect USA Inc.
Bombardier Transportation
Cintulube International LTD
Connectall LTD
Delastek USA
Doorspec
IEC Holden
Imeco Cable America
Luminator Technology Group
Novas Bus, Division of Prielvest Car, Inc.
Plastitel USA Inc. Total
Rose & Kiernan, Inc.
Spencerant New York Inc.
Vapor

CORTLAND COUNTY

Bennet Int. Group

DUTCHESS COUNTY

CDM Smith
Rose & Kiernan, Inc.

ESSEX COUNTY

American Sealing Co. Transport
Bus Machine Products
CDM Smith
CHA
Davis Freight
Frey Electric Construction
Gorman Enterprises
Lamar Transit Advertising
LIF-Tech Equipment
Lumsden & McCormick, LLP
Noco Energy Group
Sealing Devices Inc.
STICO Industries Inc.
Tolar Manufacturing Company
ULS Services
Urban Engineers of New York
Wendel Companies
West Herr Auto Group
Westmatic Corporation
Winter's Instruments

FULTON COUNTY

Don Brown Bus Sales, Inc.
Lippert Components, Inc.

GENESEE COUNTY

Strong Forge and Fabrication

JEFFERSON COUNTY

Empire Bus Sales, LLC
New York Air Brake
Rose & Kiernan, Inc.

KINGS COUNTY

Dronofri General Contractors
Edsal Machine Products
ETS Contracting Inc.
L.B. Electric Supply
T. Moriarty & Son Inc.

LIVINGSTON COUNTY

Mathews Buses, Inc.

MADISON COUNTY

New York Bus Sales, Inc.

MONROE COUNTY

Acro Industries, Inc.
Allied Electronics
Alstom Transportation, Inc.
ASP Industries

MONTGOMERY COUNTY

Liberty Enterprises
Mohawk Resources, LTD

NASSAU COUNTY

Air & Power Transmission Inc.
Comstock/Skarska
CDM Smith
Clever Devices, LTD
Cexpro
Graze Industries
Gramercy Group, Inc.
HAKS
Home Products
Jamaica Bearings
John P. Picoone, Inc
Tapeswitch Corporation
Thermo King of Long Island
Transday Transportation
Veneova Technologies
Zion Contracting

NEW YORK COUNTY

Alstom Transportation, Inc.
CDM Smith
CHA
Cubic Transportation Systems
New York Air Brake
Masabi
STV Consulting
Parsons Brinckerhoff
TransSystems Corp.
Urban Engineers of New York
WiggeWorks Inc.
Wilson, Irig & Associates

NIAGARA COUNTY

Diversified Manufacturing Inc.

ONEIDA COUNTY

AMETEK
Leonard Bus Sales, Inc.
Metal Solutions Inc.
Mohawk MFG
New Hartford Sheet Metal
Orion Parts
Oriskany Manufacturing

ONONDAGA COUNTY

Byrne Tire
C&S Companies
CDM Smith
Cummins Northeast, Inc.
Empire Bus Sales, LLC
LIF-Tech Equipment
Mathews Buses, Inc.
PENN Detroit Diesel-A Allison
Superior Lubricants
VTO, Inc.

ONTARIO COUNTY

Shepard Bros, Inc.

ORANGE COUNTY

CHA
Dieford
Mathews Buses, Inc.
Monroe Cable Company
Warex Terminal Corp.

QUEENS COUNTY

ABCO Refrigeration Supply Corp
Columbia Equipment Company, Inc.
J-Track LLC
Judtau Contracting Inc.
Mondial Automotive, Inc.
Montpat Construction Inc.
Montana Datacom
North American Mobile Systems
Riscoo, Inc.
Skanska USA Civil Northeast
TC Electric, LLC
Technico Construction Services
Tully Construction Services
Volamp Electrical Contractors

RENSSELAER COUNTY

Rose & Kiernan, Inc.
Total Tool
Warren Tire

ROCKLAND COUNTY

Breg DOT
Halmar International

ST. LAWRENCE COUNTY

Arki OEM Corporation
CDM Smith
Rose & Kiernan, Inc.

SARATOGA COUNTY

American Natural Gas (ANG)
Easybus, Inc.
Leonard Bus Sales, Inc.

TECHNOLOGIES

Seifert Graphics Inc.

WARREN COUNTY

Warren Tire

SCHEMECTADY COUNTY

Byrne Tire
C&S Companies
CDM Smith
Cummins Northeast, Inc.
Empire Bus Sales, LLC
LIF-Tech Equipment
Mathews Buses, Inc.
PENN Detroit Diesel-A Allison
Superior Lubricants
VTO, Inc.

STEBUYEN COUNTY

Alstom Transportation, Inc.
Advanced Transit Manufacturing
Diversity Mattes 2US LLC
Gray Manufacturing Industries
Lin Industries
TTA Systems, LLC

SUFFOLK COUNTY

ABT Products & Services Ltd.
B&B Electro-Mechanical
Components
BAE Systems
Clean Energy
Clean-VU Lighting
Creating Designs & Fabrications
Forte Construction Corp.
Kelly & Hayes Electrical
Matrix Railway Corp.
Mitsubishi Electric Power Products
Northeastern Bus Rebuilders
Powerhouse Industries Powertech
Controls Co. Inc
Tap Electrical Contracting
SVS Inc.
Twincro MFG Co. Inc
Wendel Companies

ULSTER COUNTY

Rose & Kiernan, Inc.

WARREN COUNTY

Adirondack Auto Supply
Warren Tire

WAYNE COUNTY

Rochester Industrial Control

WESTCHESTER COUNTY

CAPTECH, Inc.
Eco III Enterprises Inc
HAKS
Kawasaki Rail Car
Paul J. Scantano, Inc
PJS Electric, Inc.
Rose & Kiernan, Inc.
Tutor Perini Corp.
Warren Tire

Transit Responds To COVID-19 Crisis

Transit systems across NYS responded quickly to the COVID-19 crisis and played a vital role by:

- Providing transportation for essential workers.
- A lifeline for those without a vehicle to access jobs, food, and healthcare.
- Rapidly implementing cleaning and disinfecting protocols and operational changes to protect customers and employees.
- Transit stepped up during the pandemic under stressful conditions to maintain service, provide a safety net to support their communities and help the economy recover.
- The connections that transit provides are important to successfully reopen the economy.

But the Future is Uncertain

- Projected State budget shortfall of \$15 billion; \$70 billion over 4 years
- MTA financial crisis (\$12 billion, 2-year need; capital plan on hold)
- Additional costs for cleaning and disinfecting
- Pace of reopening/economic recovery/return to workplaces
- Evolving school/college transportation plans
- Future State dedicated revenue levels (PBT, auto rental fee, downstate dedicated taxes)
- Uncertain Federal relief for state/local governments and for transit
- Implementation of COVID-19 vaccine

Operating Impacts

Current trends

- Ridership and passenger revenue down 40% to 60%
- STOA reduction of 27-31%
- CARES Act funds depleted

Importance of State aid

- Upstate - \$238 million
- Downstate Suburban - \$410 million
- Typically funds 40% or more of operating costs

Federal Relief a Necessity!

5-Year Non-MTA Capital Needs

Capital Funding Needs and Gap (millions of dollars)

	<u>Bus</u>	<u>Rail</u>	<u>Total</u>
Needs	\$1,543	\$189	\$1,732
Resources	<u>\$604</u>	<u>\$109</u>	<u>\$713</u>
Gap	\$939	\$80	\$1,019

- *Upstate and Downstate transit systems require \$1.7 billion over the next 5 years to maintain infrastructure in a state of good repair and make strategic investments.*
- **The combination of all funding resources expected to be available from all levels of government over the 2020-2024 period totals \$713 million, leaving a \$1.019 billion funding gap.**

EV Plans

MTA And 5 Systems Transitioning To Battery Electric Buses

- NFTA, RGRTA, CDTA, Westchester and Suffolk Counties

2 Systems Are Largely CNG Powered Fleets

- CNYRTA, NICE Bus (Nassau County)

Others Piloting BEB

- TCAT (Ithaca)
- UCAT (Ulster County)

Financial Issues

- Incremental cost of electric vehicles
- Charging equipment
- Facility and infrastructure upgrades
- Connection to the electric grid
- EV cost is over and above core infrastructure needs

Transit Finances - Impact on CLCPA Goals

- Revenue loss and future deficits will impact achievement of climate goals:
 - Reduced service area and frequencies
 - Shift customers to less efficient modes
 - Deferred capital projects; slow transition to EV
- Existing transit services:
 - Save 17 M tons of carbon annually
 - Result in lowest energy use per capita
- Reductions in transit service from current levels will reduce these positive environmental impacts and make future environmental improvement more challenging

Transit Service Improvements

- Transit Network Redesigns
 - Reimagine RTS (ready to implement)
 - Westchester County Bee Line (underway)
 - Ithaca TCAT (underway)
- BRT
 - CDTA
 - Suffolk County
- NFTA Light Rail extension
- Technology
 - New fare payment
 - Trip planning
 - Real time schedule info
- Partner/Integrate Other Mobility Options
 - TNCs
 - Microtransit
 - Micromobility

THANK YOU

www.nytransit.org

info@nytransit.org

Discussion

Next Steps/Open Discussion

www.Climate.ny.gov

Discussion

Transportation Advisory Panel Members

**Marie Therese
Dominguez, Chair**
NYSDOT

Jared Snyder
NYSDEC

Paul Allen, M. J.
Bradley &
Associates

Dimitris Assanis,
Stony Brook
University

Steve Finch, AAA
Western & Central
New York

Albert Gore III, Tesla

Kendra Hems,
Trucking Association
of New York

Elgie Holstein,
Environmental
Defense Fund

Renaë Reynolds,
New York City
Environmental
Justice Alliance

Porie Saikia-Eapen,
Metropolitan Transit
Authority

John Samuelson,
Transport Workers
Union of America
AFL-CIO

Nick Sifuentes,
TriState
Transportation
Campaign

Kerene Tayloe, WE
ACT for
Environmental
Justice

Julie Tighe, NYS
League of
Conservation Voters

Craig Turner, Buffalo
Niagara
International Trade
Gateway
Organization

Nancy Young,
Airlines for America

Bob Zerrillo, New
York Public Transit
Association