

Energy Efficiency & Housing Advisory Panel
Meeting 9 | March 16th, 2021

Attendance

Attendees:

- RuthAnne Visnauskas, Commissioner, New York State Homes and Community Renewal (Chair)
- Janet Joseph, Senior Vice President, Strategy and Market Development, New York State Energy Research and Development Authority
- Peggie Neville, Deputy Director of Clean Energy, Department of Public Service
- Gina Bocra, Chief Sustainability Officer, New York City Department of Buildings
- Jin Jin Huang, Executive Director, Safari Energy, LLC
- Clarke Gocker, Director of Policy and Strategy, PUSH Buffalo
- Jamal Lewis, Senior Policy and Technical Assistance Specialist, Green and Healthy Homes Initiative
- Sadie McKeown, Executive Vice President and Chief Operating Officer, The Community Preservation Corporation
- Bill Nowak, Executive Director, New York Geothermal Energy Organization
- Molly (Dee) Ramasamy, Head of Deep Carbon Reduction, Jaros, Baum and Bolles
- Daphany Rose Sanchez, Executive Director, Kinetic Communities Consulting

Not in Attendance:

- Dan Egan, Senior Vice President, Energy and Sustainability, Vornado Realty Trust
- Bret Garwood, Chief Executive Officer, Home Leasing, LLC
- Amy Sugimori, Director of Policy and Legislation/ Kyle Bragg, President, 32BJ SEIU
- Elizabeth Jacobs, Acting Executive Director, Akwesasne Housing Authority
- Laura Vulaj, Senior Vice President and Director, Sustainability, SL Green Realty Corp.

Attendance

Welcome and Overview (Ruthanne Visnauskas, NYSHCR)

- Commissioner Visnauskas kicked off the meeting and provided an overview of the agenda and meeting objectives. See slide 3 for additional details.

Input from Climate Action Council Members (Kelly Richardson, NYSHCR; Kristen Baker and Mikhail Haramati, NYSERDA)

- Kelly Richardson provided an overview of input from the Climate Action Council members provided at the February CAC meeting and a recap of the stakeholder input process to-date. See slides 5-7 for additional details.
- Kristen Baker provided an overview of stakeholder comments, including coordinated responses and comments from environmental, EJ groups, and the clean energy industry. See slides 8-11 for additional details.
- Mikhail Haramati provided an overview of comments from the real estate industry, utilities, and the City of New York. See slides 12-14 for additional details.

Discussion: Recommendations Package under Development (Emily Dean and Vanessa Ulmer, NYSERDA)

- Emily Dean and Vanessa Ulmer outlined and requested feedback on the recommendations package under development, including:
 - **Workforce – Enabling Strategy (see slide 16 for details)**
 - No additional feedback
 - **Consumer education – Enabling Strategy (see slide 17 for details)**
 - **Molly Dee:** In addition to appropriate cost, she would ask to consider the appropriate strategy for this as well. There have been many past attempts to increase consumer awareness, but would ask whether we are thinking about a different kind of marketing campaign for these measures – e.g. social media, YouTube, and other further reaching avenues, rather than some of the methods we've tried in the past.
 - **Emily Dean:** Agrees that the traditional PSAs aren't going to work. Need to lean into social media and trusted partners. Will take a multi-faceted approach beyond just the traditional messaging of the past.
 - **Vanessa Ulmer:** Case studies of effective consumer education might be another way to highlight what the panel has in mind. If there are case studies that people want to elevate, that would be great.
 - **Bill Nowak:** We have examples of ratepayer supported advertising coming from utilities and commercials from fossil fuel subsidized companies pushing natural gas. Given the CLCPA, we realize gas is a roadblock to meeting our climate goals and a very small part of the public currently understands this. Need to make it clear to the public that gas is not what they once thought it was.
 - **Molly Dee:** An important point for the residential sector is that people are making decisions based on many things beyond environmental and energy reasons, such as comfort and safety. Non-energy benefits will be important to explain to gain buy-in.
 - **Daphany Sanchez:** Agrees with everything that was said, and just want to emphasize importance of consumer education.
 - **Sadie McKeown:** It is also about getting people to change their behavior - if we consume less, we can make a big difference.
 - **Innovation – Enabling Strategy (See slide 18 for details)**
 - **Daphany Sanchez:** One point – wants to emphasize that a call out is good but not enough. Important to ensure that MWBEs and cooperatives actually have the chance to participate in procurements and projects – not only animating the market, but deploying the market in the clean energy space.
 - **Janet Joseph:** First, I think it is worth flagging the federal opportunities to leverage innovation to achieve these goals. The innovation space might be one of the parts of our agenda where we can strategically use federal funds. Second, regarding the comment you made regarding a dedicated funding stream, would just note that we have a dedicated funding stream through the Clean Energy Fund at NYSERDA, which has allocated about \$60m/year for innovation in this decarbonization space. Is the suggestion that this level is not adequate? Is there a different model that needs to be advanced?
 - **Vanessa Ulmer:** We do need to add reference to the amount being invested currently through NYSERDA. The sense is that the funding stream can scale up from the amount being invested currently. Can also

think about leveraging federal R&D investment. Scaling funding at State level (while leveraging federal funding) can have an economic multiplier in the state.

- **Vanessa Ulmer:** Proposes building out embodied carbon as its own enabling strategy rather than being nested within innovation. Notes that the staff team is working on a strategy on HFCs and refrigerants so similarly developing one on embodied carbon. Asks for feedback or counterpoints.
 - **Sadie McKeown:** This makes sense.
- **Benchmarking and Disclosure - Mitigation Strategy (see slide 19 for additional details)**
 - Vanessa Ulmer notes this strategy is focused on making sure information is available to building owners/market participants. Does not believe this set of components involves penalties for underperformance, nor would it necessarily require upgrades. As currently drafted, it's about getting the information in the hands of the market actors.

Next Steps (Melina Stratos, NYSHCR)

- Melina Stratos provides an overview of next steps, including the upcoming meeting schedule/timeline. See slide 23 for details.

Q&A and Chat

- *Richard Fennelly:* For cooling apparatus, both refrigeration and AC (they consume ~17% of electric, we suggest (1) HFC refrigerant replacement to cut direct emissions with some EE benefit coupled with (2) preventative maintenance for an added 38% indirect emissions benefit as indicated at Figure 1 of <https://k-cep.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/03/Optimization-Monitoring-Maintenance-of-Cooling-Technology-v2-subhead....pdf>. Item (2) still is not being addressed. The public is oblivious to the real need to do preventative maintenance on their fridges, freezers and AC ---- heat transfer coil cleaning is totally off everyone's radar screen and forces a 25% overuse of electric.
- *Peter Savio:* Re: embodied carbon, what scale of carbon does this represent relative to carbon from ongoing building operation?
- *Peter Skinner:* I would like to share a Report we have prepared about simplified and right sized hot water plumbing for multifamily buildings - a design palette we call Practically Perfect Plumbing. This report is based upon research upon, actual installation of and on-site performance measurement analytics of these modern designs. How would that be facilitated? We would need email addresses that would help us send out the Report. In regard to Practically Perfect Plumbing, we would like to submit this report in such a way that NYS and this council could assess this approach and consider code renovations that would help these innovations transition to new construction.
- *Jodi Smits Anderson:* I suggest that this [consumer education] is not easy, in fact, the reason it's never been done well is because it is so hard....we need to educate at so many levels of connection.
- *Dan Irizarry:* Consider our network of WAP subgrantees to engage in education effort also workforce development in disadvantaged communities
- *Jodi Smits Anderson:* Yes. We cannot just post things. There needs to be an active, cyclic, process and on many levels. And a variety of messaging as well. Some people will hear messages about climate, some need to understand the health connections, others need to be given the power to make these choices in order to engage.

- *Mehdi Hosseini*: Sharing business cases for various archetypes will be very helpful (in line with education recommendations). Installation know-hows help building owners with how to go about it
- *Sadie McKeown*: What I wanted to say is that it is also about getting people to change their behavior - if we consume less, we can make a big difference.
- *Daphany Sanchez*: ++Sadie
- *Richard Fennelly*: Current human behavior is why we are losing the planet quite frankly.
- *Jodi Smits Anderson*: ++Sadie
- *Sadie McKeown*: Perhaps a requirement for MWBE JV partnerships would help directly address EJ for any non MWBE group being awarded any of the \$60 million.
- *Daphany Sanchez*: Yup, consider talking to HPD they are doing a new JV partnership
- *Jodi Smits Anderson*: Carbon literacy for professionals. Carbon literacy overall.
- *Jamal Lewis*: This all sounds good to me, thanks everyone for their input and to the Staff team for reading through and compiling all of the feedback!