

Transportation Advisory Panel Meeting

March 18, 2021 | 1:00pm-3:00pm

Attendees

Members present:

- **Chair**, Marie Therese Dominguez, Commissioner, New York State Department of Transportation
- Jared Snyder, Deputy Commissioner, New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
- Albert Gore, Policy and Business Development, Tesla
- Bob Zerrillo, Policy Director, New York Public Transit Association
- Dimitris Assanis, Assistant Professor, Stony Brook University
- Elgie Holstein, Senior Director for Strategic Planning, Environmental Defense Fund
- Julie Tighe, President, New York League of Conservation Voters
- Kendra Hems, President, Trucking Association of New York
- Kerene Tayloe, Director of Federal Legislative Affairs, WE ACT for Environmental Justice
- Nancy Young, Vice President, Environmental Affairs, Airlines for America
- Steve Finch, Senior Vice President, Automotive Services, AAA Western & Central New York
- Paul Allen, Senior Vice President, M. J. Bradley & Associates
- Porie Saikia-Eapen, Director, Environmental Sustainability and Compliance, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
- Renae Reynolds, Transportation Planner, New York City Environmental Justice Alliance

Members not present:

- Craig Turner, Executive Director, Buffalo Niagara International Trade Gateway Organization
- John Samuelson, International President, Transport Workers Union

Key staff present:

- Adam Ruder, New York State Energy Research & Development Authority
- Paul Beyer, Department of State
- Ron Epstein, Department of Transportation
- Carolyn Ryan, Department of Transportation

Guest speaker(s):

- Geoff Morison, Cadmus

Meeting Notes

Welcome and Introduction

- Commissioner Dominguez welcomed everyone, expressed thanks for their continued engagement, and ran through the agenda.
- Carolyn Ryan conducted roll call.

Review of Cadmus Policy Briefs on Biofuels and Hydrogen

- Commissioner Dominguez welcomed Dr. Geoff Morrison.

- Dr. Morrison provided a review of Cadmus policy briefs on biofuels and hydrogen, which is part of the New York State Clean Transportation Roadmap (see slides).

Discussion:

- Commissioner Dominguez: Renae, do you want to jump in with the concerns around the impacts of biofuels?
- Renae: Yes, I included a link to the NY Renew Report "[False Solutions](#)" in the chat. One of the points raised from this report is the timeframe with which carbon is reabsorbed through plants. This is one point among a number of others that were raised in the report.
- Geoff: I haven't read the report, and would need to gather my thoughts on that to provide a better answer.
- Julie: It depends on the feedstocks. If you're reducing emissions from wastewater treatment plants or if collecting fugitive emissions from various sources, it can be a good thing, but it varies.
- Dimitris: Something important to know about the NY Renew's False Solutions report is that it was not peer-reviewed. Its claims should be taken with a grain of salt or reviewed independently.
- Commissioner Dominguez: Geoff, if you could take a look at it, I think everyone would appreciate it.
- Julie: On the slide "Policy Insights | High-Priority Policies", you showed cost impacts. In the Economics & Finance table, can you describe what the dollar signs mean there?
- Geoff: It is basically the expense to the State of New York to implement these policies.
- Julie: A low-carbon fuel standard (LCFS) is a way to inject funds to move off of fossil fuels.
- Geoff: Maybe you could put a negative dollar sign there, but we were thinking more about the cost directly to the state government, but you're right.
- Commissioner Dominguez: Can you clarify more here?
- Geoff: The dollar sign represents cost to the state. The scale is one, two, or three dollar signs, so one dollar sign is the lowest cost.
- Julie: The amount of electric use in this sector is less than 1%?
- Geoff: Yes, in California in year 9, it is around 1%.
- Julie: There is a long way to go for all of us on that side.
- Geoff: As CA and OR were progressing through their LCFS, electric vehicles were at a very different stage than if NY started an LCFS now. The amount of credits you can get from EVs could also change the calculus. Credits can be weighted in different ways to incentivize different fuels.
- Albert: Was there an estimate of when the industry thinks there will be a 500-mile range hydrogen truck for under \$300k available? That's a threshold.
- Geoff: I haven't seen that. I can go back and check.

Review of Advisory Panel Recommendations for Clean Fuels and Market Based/Finance strategies

- Commissioner Dominguez introduced this agenda item and passed the floor to Jared.
 - Commissioner Dominguez: I would like to ask all panelists to review the strategies from each subgroup and provide comments prior to the April meeting. That way we can focus on finalizing the recommendations during that meeting.

- Jared Snyder presented draft panel recommendations for market-based/finance strategies (see slides).
 - Adam Ruder presented draft panel recommendations for electrification financing strategies (see slides).
 - Ron Epstein presented draft panel recommendations for various market-based/financing policies (see slides)

Discussion:

- Paul: Procedural question - I just want to clarify that we'll have another opportunity to provide comments and thoughts.
- Commissioner Dominguez: Yes.
- Paul: It's helpful for all of us to remember that previously we've talked about setting standards, such as Advanced Clean Cars II (ACCI) and Advanced Clean Trucks (ACT), and that suggests to me that this portfolio of very complementary financing and market-based policies are vital to being ready to have the owners and operators ready for EVs, so they can take hold in a meaningful way. What I'll say about the Transportation and Climate Initiative (TCI) is that it would raise \$300-350 million in the first year of operation and then every year after. That would be available as early as 2023. This is valuable in its own right but the money is valuable because it comes soon. Some of these other programs will take time to get into place. As some of the Cadmus analyses have shown, the state is not on the trajectory to meet its goals. There is some urgency about finding good places to start and proceeds that can be deployed in a thoughtful way that makes future steps easier and/or possible to take. It's important to think about all of these and how they are interrelated and how they can be put to the highest and best use. It's important to acknowledge there is a time component of highest and best use.
- Julie: To Paul's point, we need to do all of the above. We need to be doing all we can in the meantime to reduce emissions in sectors that won't be fully electrified for 10-20 years. That's where the low carbon fuel standard can really help. We need to reduce emissions and have the fossil fuel industry pay for it. I am a big fan of congestion pricing and am excited to see that as a recommendation. We also need to think about applying it beyond NYC. It will get people out of cars and into public transit and micro-mobility. We should also be thinking about aviation and off-road equipment. There are ways of learning about how these programs have worked elsewhere.
- Commissioner Dominguez: With regards to your comments about the freight sector, that's why we're doing a freight roundtable, because we need to continue to have a long-term view and integrate it in our work.
- Porie: We somehow very quickly got past smart growth strategies. We should be talking about them in every single strategy we develop. It is going to be really very important to incorporate smart growth and land use. One relies on the other. Public transportation and land use are so interrelated. As we talk about resilience, it is a part of smart growth. It all ties back to smart growth. It would be great to integrate all of this with smart growth policies because these recommendations are going to become the state's strategies. There needs to be some sort of entity that is supporting municipalities in implementing the recommendations. My comments are not specific to this presentation, but I just wanted to bring that up because it is sort of the elephant in the room.
- Commissioner Dominguez: That's the challenge. We're trying to pull all of the work together.

Provide overview of Existing New York State Electric Vehicle Programs

- Commissioner Dominguez introduced this agenda item, which is focused on answering panelists questions with regards to what the state is currently doing with electric vehicle programs.
- Adam Ruder provided an overview of electric vehicle programs in New York State (see slides).

Discussion:

- Albert: Quick comment on the Direct Current Fast Charging (DCFC) program. There was a lot of debate on the design of that program. One of the primary arguments we're hearing against rate design is that it has been addressed through this program. With the goals of over 2,000 chargers, there are only 70 being deployed which I think is a helpful data point to show that rate design still needs to be addressed.

Next Steps / Open Discussion

- Commissioner Dominguez reviewed next steps (see slides) and closed the meeting.