Climate Justice Working Group Meeting

April 20, 2022
Meeting Procedures

Before beginning, a few reminders to ensure a smooth discussion:

- Working Group Members should be on mute if not speaking.
- If using phone for audio, please tap the phone mute button.
- If using computer for audio, please click the mute button on the computer screen.
- Video is encouraged for Working Group members, particularly when speaking.
- To ask a question or make a comment, please use the hand raise function. Click the participant panel button for the hand raise function. Someone will call on members individually, at which time please unmute yourself.
- Please state your name before speaking.

At bottom of screen:
Roll Call
Agenda for April 20, 2022

- DAC Ed Sessions and Hearings Update
- CAC Update
  - Public hearings on draft Scoping Plan
  - Meetings
- Disadvantaged Communities for Air Monitoring Screening
  - Proposed communities
Public Engagement on Draft DAC Criteria
DEC hosted two education sessions on April 13th and April 19th. The event on the 19th was live translated into Spanish. Both recordings will be available on the climate.ny.gov site.
Public Hearings
Hearings on Draft DAC Criteria

- Ten hearings statewide May through June
- Mix of in-person and virtual via WebEx
- Legislative hearings format with brief and targeted overview of DAC criteria
- Registration recommended to ensure local residents are prioritized to speak
- Two-minute time limit, full remarks may be submitted for the record
## Hearings on Draft DAC Criteria

### Tentative Hearings Plan

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Hearing</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>NYC Hearing #1</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>May 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NYC Hearing #2</td>
<td>In-person, Queens</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Hudson Valley Hearing #1</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mid-Hudson Valley Hearing #2</td>
<td>In-person, Poughkeepsie</td>
<td>May 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central NY &amp; Mohawk Valley Hearing</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western NY Hearing #1</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Western NY Hearing #2</td>
<td>In-person, Buffalo</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finger Lakes/Southern Tier Hearing #1</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Country/ Capital Region Hearing</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>June 2022</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Long Island Hearing</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
<td>May 2022</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Climate Action Council Update
## Remaining 2022 Scoping Plan Public Hearings Schedule

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Address</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>April 26</td>
<td>4:00PM</td>
<td>Syracuse</td>
<td>SUNY ESF</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>April 27</td>
<td>3:30PM</td>
<td>Buffalo</td>
<td>Buffalo &amp; Erie County Public Library</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 3</td>
<td>4:00PM</td>
<td>Brooklyn</td>
<td>NYC College of Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 7</td>
<td>10:00AM</td>
<td>WebEx</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 10</td>
<td>4:00PM</td>
<td>Tupper Lake</td>
<td>The WILD Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>May 11</td>
<td>4:00PM</td>
<td>WebEx</td>
<td>Virtual</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:**
- The deadline for written public comment submissions was extended to June 10
- If COVID safety measures are warranted, in-person hearings will be held virtually at the same scheduled time
- Visit: [https://climate.ny.gov/](https://climate.ny.gov/) and click on the 'Meetings and Events' tab for updated hearing information
Disadvantaged Communities for Air Quality Monitoring - Selection
Community Air Monitoring

• Statewide screening effort in 10 communities burdened by air pollution
  ▪ Introduced by Governor Hochul Climate Week 2021
• Complemented by community-driven initiatives
  ▪ Capacity-building for EJ community groups in the 10 communities
  ▪ Local monitoring in 4 communities, led by grassroots EJ organizations
Mobile air quality screening using high-resolution sensors to provide comparison and evaluation across neighborhoods and drive solutions to reduce pollution
Air Quality Monitoring Statewide Screen

Purpose:

- Identify air quality issues in DACs for future emissions reductions, for example:
  - Long-term (e.g., diesel emissions reductions, regulations addressing stationary sources)
  - Short-term (e.g., local facility inspection, permit enforcement)
- Empower communities with easy-to-understand information on air pollution
- Locate leaks in natural gas infrastructure
- Identify sources of GHGs and other pollutants
Air Quality Monitoring Statewide Screen

- 10 communities, 5 million people
- Air quality screening conducted using mobile screening approach to obtain estimated annual averages for each pollutant in each of 10 communities
- Information collected block by block (100m road segment)
- Consistent methodology allows results to be comparable within the project
Air Quality Monitoring Statewide Screen

Year-long monitoring screen in 10 communities

- Four communities beginning in June 2022
- Six communities beginning in September 2022
- Survey data collection through September 2023
- Final reporting in 2024
Pollutants measured include

- Carbon dioxide (CO$_2$)
- Carbon monoxide (CO)
- Nitric oxide (NO)
- Nitrogen dioxide (NO$_2$)
- Ozone (O$_3$)
- Particulate matter (PM$_{2.5}$)
- Methane (CH$_4$)
- Ethane (C$_2$H$_6$)
- Black carbon
- Targeted toxics monitoring:
  - benzene, toluene, ethylbenzene, xylenes
Data Quality

• DEC operates robust network of 54 sites that generate 1.4 million+ data points annually
• 25 sites in Potential Environmental Justice Areas
• Aclima’s survey measurements will be adjusted to match DEC network data, removing the impact of varying background concentrations
Air monitoring data will be collected by Aclima sensor node platform:

- San Francisco-based public benefit corporation
- Uses internet-connected air quality sensors and operates a software platform to analyze the data
- Analyzes the block-by-block data and produces gradient maps
- Results available on the cloud-based software, Aclima Pro™
Provides access to high resolution data within selected communities to DEC, CJWG and participating CBOs with Aclima Pro™

Will incorporate other data, including locations of sensitive receptors and community-led complementary monitoring efforts
Statewide screen will use Aclima’s fleet of vehicle-mounted sensor nodes to collect data by driving at least 20 times on each road segment at different times of day, days of the week, and seasons of the year to measure air pollution in the 10 communities.
Mobile Air Quality Screening

Data are:
• Hyper-local
• 100-meter roadway segments
• Wide spatial coverage
• Helpful for identifying potential local sources of air pollution

Data are **not**:
• Regulatory monitors
  Data cannot be compared to the NAAQS, or used alone for enforcement purposes
• Designed to characterize an individual’s exposure or risk
BlocPower Partnership: Expanded Jobs Program in New York City
Air Burdened Communities
How We're Using Draft DAC Criteria

- Directed by CLCPA, utilizing DAC criteria and draft designations
- Final boundaries drawn in the 10 communities based on air quality considerations and community input
Air Pollution Burden Indicators

- Traffic: Proximity to diesel trucks and buses, and overall vehicle density
- Select pollutants: Particulate matter ($PM_{2.5}$), and benzene
- Proximity to:
  - Remediation Sites
  - Regulated Management (Chemical Sites)
  - Major Oil Storage
  - Active Landfills
  - Power Generation
  - Municipal Waste Combustors
  - Scrap Metal Processors and Vehicle Dismantlers
  - Industrial/Manufacturing/Mining Land use (Zoning)
Rank all tracts from high (100%) to low (0%) by burden score percentile.

- Divide into 3 groups:
  - Top: 67 to 100%
  - Middle: 33 to 67%
  - Bottom: <33%
- Separate NYC from the rest of the state (Outside of NYC)
- Group DAC census tracts with top air burden
  - NYC community districts
  - ROS community name
- Sort by population
Air Pollution Burden Score

Select DACs with:

- Air Pollution Burden Scores $\geq 90\%$
- Four or more Air Pollution Indicators above the 67% percentile rank

This process allows us to:

- Pinpoint areas with more air pollution indicators, higher burden, and population
- Further evaluate DACs near the area for selection
Communities Identified As Higher Air Pollution Burden
Communities Identified As Higher Air Pollution Burden Outside NYC

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Average of Air Pollution Burden Score</th>
<th>Number of Census Tracts</th>
<th>Total Population Count</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mount Vernon/Yonkers</td>
<td>88.28</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>224,176</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hempstead</td>
<td>88.17</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>45,457</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buffalo/Tonawanda/Niagara Falls</td>
<td>86.16</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>202,915</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capital Region</td>
<td>85.71</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>102,958</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rochester</td>
<td>73.01</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>143,231</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Syracuse</td>
<td>62.12</td>
<td>41</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Air pollution burden scores are calculated separate from NYC
Communities Identified As Higher Air Pollution Burden in NYC
Reporting & Response Actions
DEC, in coordination with local CBOs, will provide periodic updates to the community
Reporting

Participating CBOs and CJWG will have access to preliminary and first-available data through Aclima Pro™ platform.

DEC working with participating CBOs and community stakeholders will provide interim progress updates and data summaries.

Final report after a year of data has been collected will be shared with the communities.
Response Activities

• DEC monitors data as it comes in and will take appropriate action in consultation with community stakeholders.
• Following the conclusion of year-long community screening, DEC will identify elevated areas and potential source contributions.
• Assessment will be used to develop short-term actions and long-term strategies to address air quality issues identified by the screening with community stakeholders.
• Actions could include additional monitoring to isolate issues, enforcement, and regulatory/permitting actions.
Next Steps

• April/May: Outreach to CBOs in four communities selected for first phase:
  • Propose WNY, Capital Region, Bronx and Manhattan/Queens
• Outreach will help to define boundaries of areas to be monitored and structure of stakeholder engagement
  • Considering air pollution indicators and location of sources of concern
Community-Led Monitoring
Community-Led Monitoring

- Grant opportunities will be available to support NGO capacity building for air monitoring in the 10 communities.
- Additional community-led monitoring efforts planned in four targeted communities with available grant funding.
- Complementary monitoring led by CBOs via competitive grant process.
Community-Driven Monitoring

- Projects in the same or different communities from screening effort
- May include additional pollutants
- Design of locally driven projects to support existing efforts, provide more data points, engage communities
Thank You

- Margaret LaFarr
- Assistant Director,
  Division of Air Resources,
- 625 Broadway, Albany, NY 12233

Connect with us:
Facebook: www.facebook.com/NYSDEC
Twitter: twitter.com/NYSDEC
Flickr: www.flickr.com/photos/nysdec
Public Comments on DAC Criteria

- For more information visit: [https://climate.ny.gov/Our-Climate-Act/Disadvantaged-Communities-Criteria](https://climate.ny.gov/Our-Climate-Act/Disadvantaged-Communities-Criteria)
- Written comments may be submitted until **July 7, 2022** by email or by mail and are weighted the same as making an oral statement.

- Send written comments by U.S. Mail to:
  
  NYS DEC, Draft DAC Comments
  Attn. Office of Environmental Justice
  625 Broadway, 14th Floor
  Albany NY 12233

- Email comments to: DACComments@dec.ny.gov