Meeting Procedures

Before beginning, a few reminders to ensure a smooth discussion:

> CAC Members should be on mute if not speaking.
> If using phone for audio, please tap the phone mute button.
> If using computer for audio, please click the mute button on the computer screen (1st visual).

> Video is encouraged for CAC members, in particular when speaking.

> In the event of a question or comment, please use the hand raise function (2nd visual). You can find the hand raise button by clicking the participant panel button (3rd visual). The co-chairs will call on members individually, at which time please unmute.

> If technical problems arise, please contact NYS.CAC@cadmusgroup.com.
Welcome and Roll Call
Consideration of April 18, 2022, Minutes
Co-Chair Remarks and Reflections
Update on Public Hearings and Comments
Subgroups
  • General overview
  • Economywide Policies Subgroup
Disadvantaged Communities Barriers and Opportunities Report
Next Steps
Consideration of April 18, 2022, Minutes
Co-Chair
Remarks and Reflections
Our Hearts With Buffalo
Recent Announcements

Month of May filled with policy, program, and project-based progress

• **05/18/2022** DEC Announces Draft Regulations to Reduce Waste Sent to Landfills, Improve Waste Management, and Reduce Solid Waste's Climate Change Impacts

• **05/16/2022** NYSERDA Announces $10 Million Available Through Carbon Neutral Community Economic Development Program | Will Accelerate Decarbonization and Economic Development to Revitalize Disadvantaged Communities

• **05/13/2022** NYSERDA Makes $15 Million Available for Fourth Annual Commercial and Industrial Carbon Challenge Challenge to Reduce Statewide Emissions, Combat Climate Change, Drive Economic Growth

• **05/12/2022** PSC Announces CLCPA Tracking Initiative

• **05/12/2022** PSC Begins Groundbreaking Planning Process to Reduce Greenhouse Gas Emissions from the State’s Natural Gas Delivery System

• **05/11/2022** New York State to Hold Public Hearings on Draft Disadvantaged Communities Criteria

• **05/03/2022** Governor Hochul Announces New York State AFL-CIO President Mario Cilento Appointed to the Climate Action Council | Appointment Will Provide Labor Representation in Work of the Council
Update on Public Hearings and Comments
Draft Scoping Plan Public Hearings

✓ April 5, 4:00  Bronx Community College, Bronx
✓ April 6, 4:00  Brookhaven Town Hall, Brookhaven
✓ April 12, 4:00  Binghamton University, Binghamton
✓ April 14, 4:00  Empire State Plaza, Albany
✓ April 26, 4:00  SUNY-ESF, Syracuse
✓ April 27, 3:30  Buffalo & Erie County Public Library, Buffalo
✓ May 3, 4:00  NYC City College of Technology, Brooklyn
✓ May 7, 10:00am  Virtual
✓ May 10, 4:00  The Wild Center, Tupper Lake
✓ May 11, 4:00  Virtual
✓ May 12, 4:00  Paramount Hudson Valley Theater, Peekskill

Written comment submissions:

• Comment form at Climate Act website
• Email to scopingplan@nyserda.ny.gov
• U.S. mail sent to Draft Scoping Plan Comments, NYSERDA, 17 Columbia Circle, Albany, NY 12203

Comment period ends June 10, 2022

See https://climate.ny.gov/CAC-Meetings-and-Materials for hearing recordings
Written Comments

Steady stream of comment submissions continue

> Nearly 18,000 comments received since January 1, 2022
> Will require significant effort to review

Planned comment review

> Every comment will be reviewed
> General feedback will be noted, and specific feedback sorted by topic area (e.g., transportation, buildings)
> Feedback will be synthesized and presented to Council and subgroups for consideration
> Based on Council discussions, staff will propose approaches to incorporate/respond to feedback
> Public comments will also be processed for posting to https://climate.ny.gov
## 2022 Workplan

### Information Gathering

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Apr</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>Jun</th>
<th>Jul</th>
<th>Aug</th>
<th>Sep</th>
<th>Oct</th>
<th>Nov</th>
<th>Dec</th>
<th>Post-2022</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Climate Action Council Mtgs</strong></td>
<td>Launch subgroups</td>
<td>Barriers and Opportunities Report</td>
<td>TBD</td>
<td>Public comments/subgroup topics</td>
<td>Public comments/subgroup topics</td>
<td>Public comments/subgroup topics</td>
<td>Review revisions to draft</td>
<td>Discuss final adjustments to Scoping Plan</td>
<td>Vote on Scoping Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public Input</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public provides comments</td>
<td>Public comment distillation &amp; presentation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subgroups</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop charge &amp; solicit volunteers</td>
<td>Develop recommendations</td>
<td>Interim recs shared with CAC</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Scoping Plan Development</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Propose specific updates</td>
<td>Incorporate subgroup materials and public comment</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| | | | | | | | | | State Energy Plan; DEC Regulations

### State Energy Plan; DEC Regulations

- Issue Scoping Plan

---

The table outlines the key activities planned for each month from April to December, along with the corresponding post-2022 activities.
Subgroups
Subgroup Expectations & Process

Three Subgroups formed
> Gas System Transition
> Alternative Fuels
> Economywide Policies

Made up of 6-10 Council members
> Reflective of overall diversity of Council
> Volunteers, adjusted for balance by co-chairs

Responsibilities of subgroup members
> Meet twice a month between Council meetings, attendance should be consistent (June – August)
> Recommendations should take into consideration public comments (written & hearings)
> Strive to reach consensus on recommendations to Council
> Will be supported by State staff team and CBI/Cadmus facilitation

How will the Council & public track the work of the Subgroups?
> Meeting summaries of decisions, work products, and next steps posted on Climate Act website
> Interim progress reports at monthly Council meetings
Subgroup Membership

Gas System Transition
- Doreen Harris
- Roberta Reardon
- Rory Christian
- Donna DeCarolis
- Gavin Donohue
- Dennis Elsenbeck
- Bob Howarth
- Raya Salter
- Paul Shepson
- Mario Cilento

Alternative Fuels
- Doreen Harris
- Mary Bassett
- Richard Ball
- Donna DeCarolis
- Anne Reynolds
- Dennis Elsenbeck
- Bob Howarth
- Peter Iwanowicz
- Rory Christian

Economywide Policies
- Basil Seggos
- MarieTherese Dominguez
- Justin Driscoll
- Gavin Donohue
- Anne Reynolds
- Peter Iwanowicz
- Hope Knight
Economywide Policies Subgroup
Economywide Policies Subgroup – Purpose

Scoping Plan Directive

> The draft Scoping Plan identified 3 potential purposes that could be served by an economywide (or sector(s)-specific) program:

1) ensuring compliance with the statewide emission limits;
2) providing funding that may be needed to implement other Scoping Plan strategies; and
3) providing a uniform price signal across the economy to drive efficient decision-making.

> The Council should decide in the final scoping plan if an economywide policy or combination of policies is needed and, if so, which of three identified options best fulfills the needs identified by the CAC.

Workgroup Purpose

> This subgroup will develop its recommendation for an economywide program based on expert analyses, public input and application of the criteria identified in the draft scoping plan and others the subgroup deems appropriate.
Economywide Policies Subgroup – Areas of Focus

Key Focus Areas

> Evaluation of need for economywide program to provide a portion of the funding, achieve emission limits or both
> What policy model would best achieve policy goals
> Level of ambition, considering emission reductions and affordability
> Policy design to prioritize emission reductions in disadvantaged communities, support just transition and mitigate regressive impacts on LMI New Yorkers
> How to limit emission leakage and support innovation in NY’s economy
> Consideration of potential effect on economy and job growth
> Application economywide or to subgroup of sectors
> Consideration of multiple programs and their possible interactions
> Participation in multistate programs and consideration of best practices from other jurisdictions
Economywide Policies Research Priorities

Addressable Research Areas

1. What are the best practices for policy design and tradeoffs of different approaches?

2. What has been the experience of effects on emissions, equity and the economy in other jurisdictions?

3. What are the modeled impacts of an illustrative fixed-trajectory, energy-based carbon tax to New York’s economy and emissions? Potential impacts to evaluate include:
   a) Emission reduction
   b) Economywide energy spending
   c) Emissions and economic leakage

4. How might carbon price and potential revenues impact investment decisions for key technologies? How does investment contribute to achieving New York’s decarbonization targets?
May 26, 2022
Climate Action Council member briefing – Barriers and Opportunities Report
Section 6(1)-(3) of Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act

Report on barriers to, and opportunities for, access to and community ownership of services and commodities in the below areas, in disadvantaged communities

- Distributed renewable energy generation
- Energy efficiency and weatherization investments
- Zero- and low- emission transportation options
- Adaptation measures to improve the resilience of homes and infrastructure
- Other services and infrastructure to reduce risks associated with climate change related hazards
## Four Categories of Barriers

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Categories of Barriers</th>
<th>Examples of Barriers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Physical and Economic Structures and Conditions</td>
<td>• Building stock may be old and in disrepair&lt;br&gt;• Multifamily and rental structures create split incentives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Financial and Knowledge Resources and Capacity</td>
<td>• Community members may lack access to capital&lt;br&gt;• Communities have limited programmatic and information capacity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perspectives and Information</td>
<td>• Communities may be unaware or uncertain of risks and needs&lt;br&gt;• Communities may have a lack of trust in the program or service provider</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programmatic Design and Implementation</td>
<td>• Program not well designed for community members&lt;br&gt;• Program eligibility requirements may eliminate certain communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specific Barrier</td>
<td>Individual and Household level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program eligibility constraints and application requirements may eliminate certain communities.</td>
<td>Programs requiring home ownership or new technology purchase.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Income eligibility varies and difficult to navigate; limited access for renters, technologies require capital.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Program outreach may be insufficient or misaligned.</td>
<td>Lack of awareness of programs and services because information is not provided in the best channel, source, language, or format.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theme</td>
<td>Recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensure Inclusive Processes</td>
<td>1. Co-design programs with communities and other stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>2. Provide meaningful opportunities for public input in government processes and</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>proceedings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>3. Work across intersecting issues and interests to address needs holistically</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Streamline Program Access</td>
<td>4. Transition to program models that require little to no effort to participate and benefit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5. Establish people-centered policies, programs, and funding across local, state, and federal governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>6. Find and support resource-constrained local governments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Address Emerging Issues</td>
<td>7. Mobilize citizen participation and action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Improve housing conditions and adherence to local building codes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Recommendations and Opportunities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ensure Inclusive Processes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recommendation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Co-design programs with communities and other stakeholders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Opportunities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Staff agencies and fund programs to implement co-design processes with communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Build trust by dedicating time and resources to develop relationships with communities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Co-design with and for the most vulnerable New Yorkers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop wealth-building and asset-building options or pathways</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Next Steps…

The Final Scoping Plan will include the recommendations from this report after consultation with the CAC.
NYSERDA, DEC, and NYPA will establish a process to make the report a living document.

Phase 1: Assessment of Recommendations

Phase 2: Implementing Recommendations

Phase 3: Continued Assessment and Refinement
**Phase 1: Assessment of Recommendations**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sort each recommendation by</th>
<th>Access the current uptake of clean energy programs in disadvantaged communities and explore current community ownership models</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Implementing agency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Priority</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Feasibility</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Accelerate the creation of structures to coordinate interagency collaboration like the Low-Income Energy Task Force and expand engagement with community members and local governments like the EEC, Clean Energy Hubs, DEC Air Monitoring, CSC etc.

Create year-end goals for achieving measurable progress, accountability, and transparency
## Phase 2: Implementing Recommendations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Implement the recommendations based on priority and complexity; Incorporate community member input in this work on an ongoing basis</td>
<td>Develop a process to record new learnings and insights, which will be used to update the recommendations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Make tangible progress towards acquiring the additional resources needed for implementation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Phase 3: Continued Assessment and Refinement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Task</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Develop a reporting plan to provide updates on progress</td>
<td>Report on progress to NYSERDA, DEC, and NYPA CAC, CJWG, community members, and other relevant stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop a plan to assess the implementation of these recommendations and use that information to update them in concert with the Scoping Plan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Climate Act Requirements

• Led by DEC in cooperation with NYSERDA and NYPA
• Hold two public hearings (completed Nov 2021)
• **Submit to the Governor, Speaker of the Assembly, and the Majority Leader of the Senate**¹ by January 1, 2022
• Post to the DEC website
• The CAC’s Final Scoping Plan must include recommendations from this report
• CLCPA implementation reporting includes an assessment of the report recommendations; must be published every four years

¹Climate Act specifies “Temporary President of the Senate”
Next Steps
Next Steps

Subgroups
> Subgroups to initiate meeting in early June and meet ~ 2 times/month
> Meeting summaries (decisions, work products, and next steps) to be posted on Climate Act website
> Interim progress reports to be provided at monthly Council meetings

Comment Period
> Open through June 10, 2022
> Submit comments via:
  > [Comment form](http://climateactwebsite) at Climate Act website
  > Email to [scopingplan@nyserda.ny.gov](mailto:scopingplan@nyserda.ny.gov)
  > U.S. mail sent to Draft Scoping Plan Comments, NYSERDA, 17 Columbia Circle, Albany, NY 12203
Disadvantaged Communities Criteria

The Draft Disadvantaged Communities Criteria is open for public comment through July 7, 2022.

Written comment submission:

> Comment form at Climate Act website
> Email to DACComments@dec.ny.gov, or
> Send via U.S. mail to:
  • Attention: Draft DAC Comments
    NYS DEC Attn. Office of Environmental Justice
    625 Broadway, 14th Floor, Albany NY 12233

Two public education sessions are being offered this month as an opportunity for interested stakeholders to review the CJWG’s process and methodology for selecting DACs and to answer technical questions on the draft criteria and maps.

The Draft Criteria, supporting materials and details on joining the informational session can be found at https://climate.ny.gov/Our-Climate-Act/Disadvantaged-Communities-Criteria

A schedule for in-person and virtual public hearings on the draft criteria and indicators is being developed and will be announced soon and posted on the Climate Act website.