

CJWG Meeting Notes

WebEx - 10.20.22

Meeting Commence 2:15pm

**Not a word for word translation*

Agenda:

1. DAC Comments Overview
2. Title & Workplan for DAC Finalization
3. Air Monitoring Update
4. Scoping Plan Update
5. Next Steps:
 - Proposed Air Monitoring Training
 - Benefits & Investments Discussion
 - Proposed Economy wide Policy Discussion

Attendees:

Presenters: Alex Dunn, Alanah Keddell-Tuckey, Adriana Espinoza, Margaret LaFarr, Sameer Ranade

- ❖ Albany Board Room:
 - Alanah Keddell-Tuckey, EJ Director, Office of Environmental Justice, DEC
 - Jill Henck, Clean Energy Program Director, (ANCA) Adirondack North Country Association
 - Sonal Jessel, Policy and Advocacy Coordinator, WEACTION for Environmental Justice
 - Andrea Linton, Public Participation Specialist, Office of Communication Services, DEC
 - Margaret LaFarr, Assistant Director, Division of Air Resources, Air Resources
 - Lisa Covert, General Counsel, (DEC)
- ❖ Avon NY Board Room:
 - Abigail McHugh-Grifa, Executive Director, Climate Solutions Accelerator of the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region
- ❖ NY City Board Room:
 - Sonal Jessel, Policy and Advocacy Coordinator, WEACTION for Environmental Justice
- ❖ Utica NY Board Room:
 - Mary Beth McEwan, Executive Director, Cornell Cooperative Extension, Oneida County
- ❖ Ray Brook NY Board Room:
 - Jill Henck, Clean Energy Program Director, (ANCA) Adirondack North Country Association
- ❖ Region 9 NYS Board Room:
 - Adriana Espinoza, Deputy Commissioner for Equity and Justice, DEC

- Julie Barrett O'Neill, Regional Director, NYS DEC Region 9
- Rahwa Ghirmatzion, Executive Director, PUSH Buffalo
- ❖ Remote Attendees:
 - Tim Walsh, Regional Director, Regional Emergency Response Coordinator, Region 9, DEC
 - Jared Snyder, Deputy Commissioner of Climate, Air and Energy, DEC
 - Chris Coll, Director of Energy Affordability and Equity Program, NYSERDA
 - Sameer Ranade, Climate Justice Advisor with Climate Action Council
 - Alex Dunn, Consultant, Illume Advising
 - Neil Muscatiello, Director of the Bureau of Environmental and Occupational Epidemiology, Center for Environmental Health, DOH
 - Joe McNearney, Director of Stakeholder Engagement, DOL

Vote on Resolution:

- 10/19/2022 DEC hosted a hearing about a resolution on bylaws to allow CJWG members the ability to attend meetings virtually when extenuating circumstances arise.
 - Rules: advance notice required; members must have camera on; CJWG must have quorum of in-person members.
 - Voted yay: Chris, Neil, Joe, Sonal, Jill, Mary Beth, and Abigail, Alanah
 - Result: resolution passed

DAC Comments- Alex

- 3,124 comments received
- Just begun coding them and reviewing them in order to find breakdown of origin of comments and what is being said.
- Note: 88% of those comments were duplicates of 8 different form letters
 - Form letter themes/categories:
 - 1) Race indicators
 - 2) DAC investments
 - 3) Transparency
 - 4) Priorities
 - 5) Support
 - 6) Long Island
 - 7) ROC
 - 8) Seneca Falls
 - 142 non-form comments provided recommendations on what we should do with a DAC.
 - Commenters think X community should be considered a DAC
 - Recommend additional/different indicators to be considered

Joe: Is there a geographical breakdown of where these came from?

Alex: Not yet. We can compile that information in a sensible way and forward that to you.

Joe: Ok, thank you.

Alanah: We're working on making raw data/comments available minus commenters personal information. If needed urgently this information is available online. Alanah can circulate the link. *FYI, there will not be an additional public comment period.

Abigail: What is timeline?

Title & Workplan for DAC Finalization

Workplan and Timeline: Alanah

- We do not have a legislative timeline established for finalization of disadvantaged communities' criteria.
- 4/01/2023 is deadline goal to release finalized criteria
- Goal is to vote on final criteria in March 2023
- Goal is to keep meetings 1hr1/2 which equals more frequent meetings. Members are asked to review documentation between meetings

Sonal: Concerned about timeline not being sooner. Concerned about implications of waiting months after the scoping plan has been adopted.

Adriana: The timeline presented is a proposed draft for members to reflect on.

Abigail: Can meetings be scheduled months in advance?

Alanah: We are considering using Survey Monkey for availability because it allows scheduling months in advance. This matters due to our meetings now being in person.

Chris: Alex, do you have an early sense of what assessment level will be needed?

Alex: We are looking into that.

Rahwa: Will there be a conversation about reconciling recommendations from the scoping plan? Do the recommendations create worse issues for DACS?

Alanah: Yes, we'll be discussing re-engaging with the CAC on the scoping plan.

Air Monitoring Quality Update: Adriana

Update on the work the Division of Air Resources has been doing

- 10 communities were identified as having a high air pollution burden using 12 indicators identified by the CJWG.
- 10 Community's main complaints were discussed.39:38

- Resolution: DEC proposes establishing community advisory committees to address their concerns.
- The office of Environmental Justice will coordinate with DEC's Air Division, CJWG, and our regional offices to identify community leaders who will serve jointly with DEC as conveners.
- Members can be DEC's public participation specialists and CJWG members. We've also created a list of stakeholders in alternative communities who are welcome to participate. *This is a proposal.

Reporting: Margaret

Margaret LaFarr: The Division of Air does have a website with a map showing each area used for the study.

Abigail: How digestible of a form will the quarterly reports be in?

Margaret: Plan is to provide updates at quarterly meetings and post slides online.

Abigail: Will community leaders participating in community advisory committees receive compensation for their time?

Adriana: We would have to discuss that. We did put out a series of grants to support the community air monitoring initiative. If there was interest from applicants, yes that would qualify as eligible. CJWG members will not receive funding.

Abigail: Let me clarify, not members. Who is the target participant? Do we mean residents in DACs that we would want to serve on these committees?

Adriana: Yes we are thinking residents, local stakeholders, community-based organizations to serve on these committees. Perhaps even a local elected official to partner with us to help attract folks in.

Abigail: It's important to have diversity in representation.

Reminder to CJWG members from Margaret: Quarterly reports and licenses to use ACLIMA Pro are available to them. ACLIMA's platform includes details on where monitoring is taking place. ACLIMA is offering onboarding training for their software at our convenience. The goal of air monitoring is to develop emission reduction strategies. These earlier investigations will help with reduction strategies.

Margaret: Does working group prefer group training versus individual training for ACLIMA Pro? This training can be designated to another person in your organization.

Sonal: Yes, we would like that training for ACLIMA Pro. Don't see a need to do it individually.

Scoping Plan Update and CAC & Engagement: Sameer

Sameer: CAC received over 35,000 comments through July 1,2022. Key topics of feedback included was discussed. Three quarters of comments could be attributed to an email campaign. As of September 13,2022 proposed updates to each chapter were presented before the CAC.

Sonal: When are we expecting a clear definition of disproportionate burden?

Adriana: We can get an update and follow up with you on that.

Jared: We will be revising the draft economy wide chapter consistent with the presentation made to the Council. We welcome the CJWG's input which has not been provided yet.

Alanah: If folks are interested in following up please send her an email copying Sameer and Adriana also.

No further comments/concerns from working group

Next Steps

- Refined spreadsheet with the comments will be composed by Illume and distributed to CJWG staff for review before next CJWG meeting.
- Finalization of DAC criteria. Alanah will email everyone updates and include information in SharePoint.
- Alanah is working on planning meetings ahead of time. She will be sending a poll out and asks that members respond timely for scheduling
- Air Team will follow up with members regarding ACLIMA Pro training

Meeting Adjourned 3:26pm