

# CJWG Meeting Notes

## WebEx - 7.20.21

**Meeting Commence 1:00pm**

**Agenda:**

- A. Introductions
- B. CAC Update
- C. DAC Criteria Timeline
- D. Considered Indicators
- E. Draft Scenario
- F. Next Steps

**A)Introductions:**

- Rosa Mendez, Director, Office of Environmental Justice, DEC
- Sarah Osgood, Exec Director of Climate Action Council (CAC)
- Sonal Jessel, Policy and Advocacy Coordinator, WEACT for Environmental Justice
- Eddie Bautista, Executive Director, NYC Environmental Justice Alliance
- Elizabeth Yeampierre, Executive Director, UPROSE
- Rahwa Ghirmatzion, Executive Director, PUSH Buffalo
- Jerrod Bley, Clean Energy Program Director, Adirondack North Country Association
- Alanah Keddell-Tuckey, Public Outreach Specialist, Office of Environmental Justice, DEC
- Chris Coll, Director of Energy Affordability and Equity Program, NYSERDA
- Neil Muscatiello, Director of the Bureau of Environmental and Occupational Epidemiology, Center for Environmental Health, DOH
- Joseph McNearney, Director of Stakeholder Engagement, DOL
- Alex Dunn – Illume Advising, Consultant
- Amanda Dwelley – Illume Advising, Consultant
- Abigail McHugh-Grifa, Executive Director for Climate Solutions Accelerator
- Sameer Ranade, Climate Justice Advisor with Climate Action Council

**B)CAC Update:**

**Sarah Osgood:**

- CAC wants the CJWG's input and wants to work together to facilitate that.
- Input can be on recommendations, feedback on panels, CJWG framework, or general concerns.
- *Upcoming CAC meeting:*
  - Hold for August 2021
  - Time can be allotted for CJWG to give feedback on the remaining recommendations.
  - If ready CAC welcomes an update on latest draft of DAC criteria

- *Reminder CAC has a deadline of Jan. 1, 2022 to release a draft scoping plan.*
  - Currently working on modeling, ie) integration analysis
- *Counsel meetings going forward likely to involve analysis around scoping plan*
  - CJWG input is required. CJWG attendance and input encouraged at each CAC meeting now through November 2022.
  - CAC recognizes the CJWG is stretched with the tasks in front of them
- *Scoping Plan level of detail:*
  - Plan is more of a strategy document providing the basis on which to act on a policy recommendation.
  - Scoping plan will be high level. Every policy that advances from the scoping plan must go through its own regulatory process.
  - Note, emission reduction requirements are challenging.
  - If there are preferred policy alternatives please identify those and their features or working group can suggest how to improve the policies that have been recommended. This is preferred rather than eliminating them from consideration.

### **Discussion**

**Elizabeth:** As we provide requirements and input what is the timeframe for CAC to report back if they have been integrated and if there were challenges? Will CAC be communicating with CJWG regularly?

**Sarah:** Yes, CAC will respond. General schedule is a draft scoping plan ready for CAC members to review by mid October 2021. One month or so to follow for review. Revised draft scoping plan target/flexible deadline December 2021.

**Eddie:** How many CAC meeting opportunities will CJWG members have to provide our feedback? Need to know to time manage and plan accordingly.

**Sarah:** CAC is trying to be flexible in real time and apologizes for any timeline confusion. Currently CAC is trying to prioritize accommodating the CJWG's schedule while maintaining their own schedule for getting a draft plan out by Jan 1, 2022.

**Elizabeth:** We would like to see how recommendations from CAC are aligning with the Climate Justice Council's priorities. We'd like to see something stating specifics. She agrees with Eddie. There needs to be a firm timeline so CJWG can pace their work.

**Rahwa:** Agrees. CJWG is being very intentional when providing their recommendations (on each panel advisory body) in bite size form. It is helpful to receive feedback in the same manner rather than all at once. That will make this process more manageable in real time.

**Eddie:** Does CAC feel like they need to respond to CJWG's recommendations? We need to know so we can manage our own expectations. CAC sharing their meeting schedule for 2021 would be greatly appreciated.

**Sarah:** To clarify, CAC does want alternative policy ideas to put forward. They do want a genuine scoping plan.

**Elizabeth:** We need to hear back on how our recommendations are being integrated and prioritized. We need documentation and an honored timeline. This should be a fear for CAC as well as CJWG.

**Sarah:** Great feedback! We need to have a follow up conversation on how best to engage. Requested Rosa, Chris and Sameer help arrange a time to discuss further with CJWG members different mechanisms and paths forward.

**Rahwa:** We hear you and appreciate that a follow up meeting will happen. It's critical at the meeting to answer the above question of 'will we get a response/feedback from CAC'? This answer needs to be first on the agenda. Answer will dictate for CJWG how we move forward.

**Eddie:** Is there a public schedule of CAC meetings for the remainder of 2021? If not we strongly urge you to calendar your meetings publicly.

**Sarah:** I will pass along the request to share it. We do have meeting holds on CAC members calendars from now till October. We will publicly share and post these.

**Jared:** Shares Eddie, Elizabeth, and Rahwa's concerns regarding timelines. Will this be a bi-directional process? If so we need to account for that. We need a firm timeline.

**Abigail:** What framework is CAC using? What is the overarching method of thinking about systems change and what it requires? How is this being tracked?

**Sarah:** I do not have an immediate answer on that. This feedback is great to prepare for a future meeting.

### **C)DAC Criteria Timeline**

Week by week tentative/potential meetings and goals for said meetings

#### **Week of Jul 12:**

- Jul 12 optional 1hour map review

#### **Week of Jul 19:**

- CJWG Jul 20 pending meeting
  - Meeting agenda> timeline, review process, preview indicators, discussion
    - CAC pending meeting Jul 22

#### **Week of Jul 27:**

- CJWG Jul 27 pending meeting
  - Prep for indicators vote, Zoom into scenarios, discuss/prioritize provisions

#### **Week of Aug 2:**

- Individual work, reviews

#### Week of Aug 11:

- CJWG Aug 11 meeting
  - Agenda> consensus on draft indicators, discuss revised scenarios
    - For public DEC share draft outline/plan comment period?

#### Week of Aug 18:

- CJWG Aug 18 or 19
  - Agenda> prep for scenarios vote, final revisions, preview documentation
    - DEC share draft outline/plan for public comment period

#### Week of Aug 23:

- Tentative CAC meeting Aug 23
- CJWG Aug 26 meeting
  - Agenda> review draft scenarios before vote, review documentation, review public comment plan/outline

#### Week of Sept 6:

- In-person CJWG Meeting
  - Agenda> Vote on indicator list, vote for scenarios to post for public comment, Prep for public meetings and comment period

#### September Goals:

- 1) Post scenarios for public comment
- 2) Participate in public meetings
- 3) Start 120-day comment period

**Chris:** Rosa, can you speak more on the voting process?

#### **Rosa:**

- Original goal as a working group was to have draft published summer 2021. We can accomplish this if public comment period remains in Sept 2021.
- Per legislation we need 120 days for public comment period.
- To hit our final draft goal Dec 2021 we must engage the public by Sept 2021.
- To achieve this we must have consensus on **1) What indicators will be in the definition? This means a vote. 2) How do we combine the indicators to identify the geographic locations? This step requires public engagement.**
- Plan is to have a virtual education session to display indicators and scenarios for the public so they understand the process.
- Next hold 6 required public comment hearings.
- Next open the floor to any audience member who'd like to give a 2-3 minute comment. Audience can also submit written comment. Comments will be compiled by the state. The state will then react to those comments. Final definition will be shared.
- The idea is Alanah and Rosa work with CJWG members to decide if hybrid vs physical locations for public comment periods are best during the pandemic.
- DEC is working on the plan for this.
- \*\*Rosa will work with Alanah on providing a written plan for public engagement so everyone can react to it at the next CJWG meeting in August.

**Illume:**

- After today they will do an update based on CJWG feedback and return on July 27,2021 with an updated set of scenarios.
- Also an update on where we are with the scenarios. This way we can all feel confident when voting on the indicators.

**D) Recap of Considered Indicators:**

**Illume:**

- 160 considered> 90 obtained and evaluated data> 45 prioritized for inclusion
- Overview of indicators considered and their status.
  - a)Were we able to include them? b)If not provide the reasons why.
- ❖ Slide presentation by Illume
- ❖ Demonstration of maps by Illume

**Discussion/Comment from working group:**

**Neil:** Offered to share links for climate, weather, and health information within NYS.  
(\*see below for links)

**Illume:** They'd like to gather more specific data such as race & ethnicity.

**Eddie:** How are we adjusting for different costs of living within NY state?

**Illume:** We are not using medium income. We are using 2 variables. 1<sup>st</sup> variable=% of tracts below 80% and using 2<sup>nd</sup> variable= % tracts below federal poverty line.

**F)Rosa: Next Steps & Scheduling**

- Illume update scenario and go through it with working group
- Please provide availability for August today.
- Follow up with Sarah and the CAC meeting schedule.
- Provide written plan for public engagement before August CJWG meeting.

**NYS links for reference**

*DOH climate, weather and health:*

<https://www.health.ny.gov/environmental/weather/>

*DOH Heat vulnerability*

[https://www.health.ny.gov/environmental/weather/vulnerability\\_index/](https://www.health.ny.gov/environmental/weather/vulnerability_index/)

*DOH County heat and health profiles:*

<https://www.health.ny.gov/environmental/weather/profiles/>

**Meeting End: 4:01pm**