

**CJWG Meeting**  
**WebEx- 12/16/2020**

**At a Glance:**

- Welcome and roll call
- Review of 12/2 CJWG meeting minutes
- Discussion of draft evaluation rubric
- Check-ins with Advisory Panels
- Information regarding meetings and materials can be found on [www.climate.ny.gov](http://www.climate.ny.gov)

**Participants:**

CJWG Members-

- Elizabeth Yeampierre, Executive Director, UPROSE
- Abigail McHugh-Grifa, Executive Director, Climate Solutions Accelerator of the Genesee-Finger Lakes Region
- Sonal Jessel, Policy and Advocacy Coordinator, WEACTION for Environmental Justice
- Eddie Bautista, Executive Director, NYC Environmental Justice Alliance
- Rahwa Ghirmatzion, Executive Director, PUSH Buffalo
- Jerrod Bley, Clean Energy Program Director, Adirondack North Country Association
- Mary Beth McEwen, Executive Director, Cornell Cooperative Extension of Oneida County
- Amy Klein, Executive Director, Capital Roots
- Rosa Mendez, Director, Office of Environmental Justice, DEC
- Chris Coll, Director of Energy Affordability and Equity Program, NYSERDA
- Neil Muscatiello, Director of the Bureau of Environmental and Occupational Epidemiology, Center for Environmental Health, DOH
- Joseph McNearney, Director of Stakeholder Engagement, DOL

Presenters -

- Amanda Dwelley, Illume Advising
- Alex Dunn, Illume Advising

Advisory Panel Members-

- Lara Skinner, Just Transition Working Group
- Sadie McKeown, Energy Efficiency and Housing

- Julie Suarez, Agriculture and Forestry
- Rory Christian, Power Generation Panel
- Kevin Hansen, Energy Intensive Industry and Exposed Trades

### Meeting Start 12:03

Opening Remarks- Commissioner Basil Seggos

Rosa- Review CJWG meeting on 12/2 and finalize meeting minutes

- Eddie- The group should invite 2 representatives from CalEnviroScreen, one from government and another from an EJ Community/Organization
- Elizabeth- Recommends Dianne Tarvokian, Executive Director of Environmental Health Coalition in San Diego, and Marta Arguello, Physicians for Social Responsibility

Vote to Approve Minutes: Approved

Rosa- Review of CJWG WorkPlan

- Jerrod- It would be preferable to limit meetings to 2hrs going forward
- Chris- It could be beneficial to arrange workshops outside of the regular meetings
  - Eddie- Agreed but presentations from outside organizations (CalEnviroScreen) should be a part of the open CJWG meetings, it would be beneficial to have it available for the public.

Alex and Amanda- Presentation from Illume

- Jerrod- Expressed concern on how benefits are applied to the different “buckets”, if the application is not consistent it may not be beneficial to disadvantaged communities
  - Chris- Are GHG emissions considered pollution in the “pollution reduction umbrella”?
- From the public: Dazzle Ekblad - This umbrella diagram includes "pollution reduction". Are GHG emissions considered "pollution"? If so, this would include a broader range of state funding programs.  
Chris – pollution reduction was discussed overall. GHG should fall under the umbrella and also flag investments in clean energy  
Eddie – the 35 – 40% was intended to address GHG and we should be looking at the broader range of state funding
  - Eddie- How would the Disadvantaged Communities definition affect DEC’s EJ area framework?

- Rosa- We are currently working this out with CP-29 revisions
- Chris – We are in the beginning of the process and hope to bring the CJWG in very soon
  
- Abigail- Who holds accountability on delivering benefits to communities? What qualifies as a benefit? And what are the communities roles in determining this?
  - Chris- We expect to have community input ahead of time
  - Rosa- There will be tracking and reporting associated with the projects
  - Rahwa- How can we include in criteria who makes up the “community” input? The community needs to be a continued part of the progress
    - Amy Klein- There is a big difference in input between upstate and downstate communities
    - Abigail- There's also a difference in asking for and acting on the community input
    - Elizabeth- Important to ensure that BIPOC are not spoken for by organizations who don't accurately represent them
    - Eddie - Also, doesn't the CLCPA call for state agency audits? Are there any agency efforts underway to audit current investments geographically?
  
- Elizabeth- Community input can be a big ask for some so the working group needs to front load them with easily digestible information to allow for meaningful community engagement

Alex- presentation on example of rubric to evaluate indicators for disadvantaged communities

- Elizabeth- When looking at impacts we also need to look at people who have been historically denied and lacked access to healthcare
  - look at impacts on those who are more susceptible to health impacts. Also climate migration and refugees. Look at indicators that are people based as well as place based
- Abigail- “potentially actionable” wording could be problematic, would like to see the group think outside the box on actions that were not thought to be realistic previously
- Eddie- Why are there 8 pillars as opposed to the previous 14?
  - There doesn't appear to be a statewide database of manufacturing/industrial zones, which could prove difficult to use the rubric which is statewide
  - Alex- Are there health metrics we could use as a proxy?

- Elizabeth - manufacturing zones, abandoned manufacturing zone riddled with brownfields too. Also proximity to highways
  - Public Comment – Contact NYSGIS office to help with this data
- Amanda - Circling back to Elizabeth's question about representing people who may have been exposed to pollution or hazards elsewhere and migrated -- In addition to looking at variables about migration, her question highlights the tension between looking at pollutants in terms of exposures vs. effects. If we are only looking at exposures in an area, it wouldn't cover people who moved there. If we also look at health outcomes in an area like respiratory or cardiovascular ED visits, Low Birthweight individuals, infant mortality or premature deaths, that could also capture what people within an area have been exposed to in the past.
- Abigail- Why are we focused at the geographic level as opposed to the household level?
  - Alex- There's not enough data at the household level, geographic level may be the best way to deliver benefits even if it's imperfect
  - Eddie - Abigail's point touches on some of the gentrification questions raised earlier
- Sonal – interested in exploring potential idea to layer individual characteristics on top of the geographical ones
- Jerrod- During the process of evaluating indicators why is Data Quality not the first metric to filter out data of lower quality?

#### Advisory Panel Engagement

- Lara Skinner (JTWG)- this is an opportunity to build a more equitable economy
  - Elizabeth - NYSERDA doing good research on supply chain and NYCEDC is stepping into this area
  - Eddie- There are no EJ representatives on the JTWG so there is some concern from some groups on the green energy alternatives they're considering. Are they hearing these same concerns?
    - Lara- That has not come up in her conversations yet but there will be many panel cross-meetings which could be a good opportunity
- Sadie McKeown- Energy Efficiency and Housing Panel
  - Need to develop codes that electrify buildings over time slowly to make it more affordable although the short term cost could be high
  - Additional focus will be given to training and education
  - Eddie- Have you discussed/considered a cap and trade system for financing housing
    - Sadie- No that has not been considered

- Jamal – efficiency and weatherization in LMI and disadvantaged communities.
- Julie Suarez- Agriculture and Forestry Panel
  - Goal of the panel is mainly to decrease methane and NOx emissions by 15%
  - Reduce fossil fuel usage as defined in CLCPA
  - Carbon sequestration
  - Silvopasturing, cropping between trees, riparian buffers and agroforestry
- Eddie – EJ concerns regarding carbon capture and use. Also biofuels concerns
  - Julie – looking at nature based solutions for carbon capture in forested areas rather than urban locations: cover cropping, no till, etc. Biofuels have not really come up
- Rory Christian- Power Generation Panel
  - Focus on career development in power generation
  - There are four different subgroups within this panel
  - Also focusing on a market solution for development of battery storage
    - Jerrod- Is the group giving any consideration to hydroelectric in upstate NY?
      - Rory- Not yet, focus is mainly on bringing cleaner electricity generation to the downstate area
- Kevin Hansen- Energy Intensive Industries and Exposed Trades
  - Where emissions are coming from:
    - Onsite fuel combustion
    - Indirect Emissions
    - Non-combustion sources
  - Energy intensive sources – incentives and technical assistance explored for fazing these sources out
  - Energy efficiency and electrification as tools for decarbonization
  - Incentivize the purchase and use of green products
  - Workforce training
- Rahwa - Kevin, has there been any thought to creating opportunities for ppl who are traditionally not in this industry to participate (BIPOC and women). Not just workforce but in business development and supply chain?
- Eddie – NYSERDA’s position of hydrogen as a green fuel source considering the high concentrations of NO2

- Sonal - Has there been discussion about checks and monitoring of foul play for these big businesses/industries?

**Conclusion 3:04PM**