

Transportation Advisory Panel Meeting

April 9, 2021 | 1:00pm-3:00pm

Attendees

Members present:

- Albert Gore, Policy and Business Development, Tesla
- Bob Zerrillo, Policy Director, New York Public Transit Association
- Dimitris Assanis, Assistant Professor, Stony Brook University
- Elgie Holstein, Senior Director for Strategic Planning, Environmental Defense Fund
- Jared Snyder, Deputy Commissioner, New York State Department of Environmental Conservation
- Julie Tighe, President, New York League of Conservation Voters
- Kerene Tayloe, Director of Federal Legislative Affairs, WE ACT for Environmental Justice
- Nancy Young, Vice President, Environmental Affairs, Airlines for America
- Porie Saikia-Eapen, Director, Environmental Sustainability and Compliance, Metropolitan Transportation Authority
- Renae Reynolds, Transportation Planner, New York City Environmental Justice Alliance
- Steve Finch, Senior Vice President, Automotive Services, AAA Western & Central New York

Members not present:

- **Chair**, Marie Therese Dominguez, Commissioner, New York State Department of Transportation
- Craig Turner, Executive Director, Buffalo Niagara International Trade Gateway Organization
- John Samuelson, International President, Transport Workers Union
- Kendra Hems, President, Trucking Association of New York
- Paul Allen, Senior Vice President, M. J. Bradley & Associates

Key staff present:

- Adam Ruder, New York State Energy Research & Development Authority
- Carolyn Ryan, Department of Transportation
- Paul Beyer, Department of State
- Ron Epstein, Department of Transportation

Guest speaker(s):

- Geoff Morison, Cadmus

Meeting Notes

Welcome and Introduction

- Ron Epstein welcomed everyone, presented the agenda, and conducted roll call.
 - Commissioner Dominguez was not able to join the call today.

Review of Cadmus New York Clean Transportation Roadmap Preliminary Results: GHGs and Energy

- Ron welcomed Dr. Geoff Morrison from Cadmus.
- Dr. Morrison provided a review of preliminary greenhouse gas (GHG) and energy results from the New York State Clean Transportation Roadmap (see slides).

Discussion:

- Nancy: Our members (in Airlines for America) have all committed to achieving net zero by 2050, and we represent most of the major airlines. Sustainable aviation fuels are a key piece of that. We need to be careful not to vilify the aviation industry, because we are being really aggressive and working with the Biden Administration.
 - Adam: That's a really good point. One of the things to note about this is that the way the Climate Leadership and Community Protection Act (CLCPA) GHG accounting is set up, the emissions savings from sustainable aviation fuels won't be accounted for. It makes it a little tricky to compare these emissions to the whole economy.
 - Nancy: It's important to be clear in the narrative here. Making us look like a dirty industry is destructive.
 - Jared: There is a net zero goal in the CLCPA, which means it would look at *net* emissions. However here, we're just looking at *gross* emissions.
- Jared: What are your assumptions about federal fuel economy standards? The Biden administration has committed to strengthening those.
 - Geoff: We assumed for the next couple of years we'll be under the Trump-era fuel economy standards and then after that, we will transition to something between the levels set by the Obama administration and Trump administration, then after that efficiency improvements are based on historical data.
 - Adam: We used the emissions standards equivalent to the agreement between California and the five automakers.
 - Jared: The Obama standards were 54 mpg in 2025, which includes gasoline, hybrid electric (HEV) and plug-in hybrid electric vehicles (PHEV). I wonder if what you are modeling is ambitious enough.
 - Geoff: These are average real-world fuel economies for the entire vehicle stock. What you're quoting is only for new vehicles.
 - Jared: Yes, but presumably by 2050, there would be few vehicles on the road that were produced before 2025, but perhaps with HEV and PHEV, this is right. Maybe we're being a little conservative, given the uncertainty.
 - Ron: Another thing to look at here is the vehicle miles traveled (VMT) of the different vehicle classes. For example, school buses don't drive much, so they won't contribute much to overall GHG emissions. That vehicle class may look bad when it comes to fuel economy, but you have to consider mileage too.
 - Bob: Is it possible to calculate what smart growth and public transit policies mean from a GHG perspective? Is it possible to assign specific GHG reductions to policies?
 - Geoff: Many of these policies are interconnected, but if there is a specific policy you're interested in looking at, we can look into it.

Report out from the Environmental Justice and Public Health Roundtable

- Renee provided an overview of the Environmental Justice and Public Health Roundtable on April 6th, 2021. See notes from the roundtable for more information (posted to the [climate.ny.gov](https://www.climate.ny.gov) website).

Discussion:

- Jared: One thing I would like to emphasize is listening to and engaging with the disadvantaged communities (DACs) themselves. There was another point about the fact that incentives should

be targeted to reduce transportation inequities. This has been a problem with electric vehicle (EV) incentives so far. They have gone mostly to upper-middle class people who buy electric vehicles. There were a couple of other salient points, which you'll see reflected through the policy recommendations that will be presented today.

- Julie: It was not surprising to hear an emphasis to focus on medium and heavy-duty (MHDV) first because of their disproportionate contribution to air quality and public health issues. Although, someone else pointed out that we need to do both (light-duty and MHDV).

Review of Transportation Advisory Panel Recommendations Template

- Ron Epstein introduced this agenda item and provided an overview of the aggregated GHG emissions impact of Transportation Advisory Panel recommendations (see slides).

Review of Transportation Advisory Panel Recommendations Template – Electrification

- Adam Ruder provided an overview of the modifications to the electrification strategies (see slides).

Discussion:

- Julie: I think this reflects the conversation we've been having, such as targeting certain areas, like ports. Some places need a mandate for things to change, so adding points about getting those in place and looking at localized impacts were important additions.

Review of Transportation Advisory Panel Recommendations Template – Public Transportation

- Ron Epstein provided an overview of the modifications to the public transportation strategies (see slides).

Discussion:

- Porie: I just wanted to mention that I was part of some of these conversations and was happy to see that a lot of the things we talked about were integrated.
- Bob: It is a good set of proposals for public transportation. Thanks to the staff and panel members. It's very aggressive, but certainly appropriate.
- Kerene: You had pointed out the 12-year issue with current buses. Are there targets for new procurements?
- Ron: There are a whole series of federal requirements that we'll want to pursue. One of the other things we need to deal with is if you purchase a vehicle this year, it has a 12-year service life, so it'll remain in service until 2033. We want to see whether the federal repayment can be waived if you're replacing a diesel bus with an electric one before the end of its 12-year service life.

Review of Transportation Advisory Panel Recommendations Template – Smart Growth

- Paul Buyer provided an overview of the modifications to the smart growth strategies (see slides).
- Adam Ruder presented the Low-Carbon Modes and Smart Mobility & Connected/Automated Vehicles strategies (see slides).

Discussion:

- Porie: This is great! I'm really pleased to see all of this. The enabling initiatives are really good.

Review of Transportation Advisory Panel Recommendations Template – Market-based Policies and Financing Strategies

- Jared Snyder provided an overview of the modifications to the market-based policies and financing strategies (see slides).

Discussion:

- Julie: I think it's really important to get the framing right on the Clean Fuel Standard (CFS). It works on two fronts, to help the transition to electric vehicles, but also to clean up the MHDV side while we're making the transition. Otherwise we're going to be relying entirely on fossil fuels in the meantime. The fossil fuel industry would be paying for this transition through a CFS.
- Renae: Shouldn't we include the action type Climate and Community Investment Act (CCIA), since it has been introduced?
 - Jared: That's an option for the Council to endorse. We've been instructed to look at transportation-specific measures, whereas that is economy-wide. We could add a note about how members of the panel would support that approach.
 - Renae: I just want to make sure we're not elevating a policy, particularly like the Transportation and Climate Initiative (TCI), because we heard a lot of opposition to TCI from the environmental justice (EJ) advocates on the roundtable.
 - Jared: Right, and as I understand it, the concerns are that the investments would not occur in DACs and that emissions would not go down in DACs. We think that can be addressed by really locking down the investment strategies and making sure we invest in those communities. We can target hotspots, as identified by the EJ groups.
 - Ron: To Renae's point we should be clear about what we heard.
- Albert: Connecticut has a bill that would authorize their participation in TCI, which would require at least 50% of proceeds be invested for the benefit of disadvantaged communities. We could submit this recommendation for TCI.
 - Jared: We can note that.
 - Julie: I think it's also important to recognize the possibility to use those funds to electrify public transit, since those services are used a lot by low-to-moderate income communities. Also need to emphasize expanding public transit.
- Julie: I just want to add in on the curb pricing policy here. Is this something the common carriers are interested in? UPS and FedEx are very interested in this.
- Julie: National Resources Defense Council (NRDC) and a number of other groups have submitted comments. A lot of those align with the strategies that were presented here today. They also highlighted the importance of emphasizing low income and disadvantaged communities.

Next Steps / Open Discussion

- Ron Epstein reviewed next steps (see slides) and closed the meeting.